

DR. AMBEDKAR IN THE BOMBAY LEGISLATURE

APPENDICES

Contents

APPENDICES

[I Speech by P. J. Roham on Birth-Control on behalf of Dr. Ambedkar](#)

[II Questions asked by Dr. Ambedkar and Replies given by the Government](#)

[III Questionnaire of University Reforms Committee and Written Evidence by Dr. Ambedkar.](#)

APPENDIX I

*ON MEASURES FOR BIRTH- CONTROL

Mr. P. J. Roham (Ahmednagar South): Sir, I beg to move—

" This Assembly recommends to Government that in view of the urgent need of limiting the family units. Government should carry on an intensive propaganda in favour of birth-control among the masses of this Province and should provide adequate facilities for the practice of birth-control." Question proposed.

Mr. P. J. Roham (Addressed the House in Marathi): The educated class has, by this time, fully realised the necessity of birth-control and fortunately the leaders in our country also are unanimous on this point. Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru, Sir Ravindranath Tagore and Mrs. Sarojini Naidu, know very well the importance and the urgency of the movement for birth-control and are in favour of contraceptives. Babu Subhash Chandra Bose, the President of the Indian National Congress, said in his presidential speech :

" If the population goes up by leaps and bounds, as it has done in the recent past, our plans are likely to fall through." Even Mahatma Gandhi has written long ago as follows :

" I must not conceal from the reader the sorrow I feel when I hear of births in this land."

Very few have an adequate idea of the immense loss sustained by children born of persons who are handicapped either physically, mentally or financially. The parents as well as the society also suffer very much. The prevention of the births of such children would considerably reduce the death-rate among

mothers who succumb to child-birth and its concomitant diseases, lower infantile mortality, improve public health by removing the many diseases due to want of even the prime necessities of life felt by many persons, check the offences perpetrated by persons suffering from intense poverty and would bring about an all-round uplift of society by affording full scope to its spiritual advancement.

The present keen struggle of life renders timely marriage impossible for many and thus exposes them to various diseases and habits. Many women become invalid for life and some even lose their lives by the birth of children in their diseased condition or in too great numbers or in too rapid succession. Attempts at abortion, resorted to for the prevention of unwanted progeny, exact a heavy toll of female lives. Unwanted children are often neglected by their mothers and hence they become nothing but a burden to society which is further deteriorated by the addition of defective progeny from diseased persons. Birth-control is the only sovereign specific that can do away with all these calamities. Whenever a woman is disinclined to bear a child for any reason whatsoever, she must be in a position to prevent conception and bringing forth progeny which should be entirely dependent on the choice of women. Society would in no way profit by the addition of unwanted progeny. Only those children who are welcomed by their parents, can be of social benefit and hence every woman must be enabled to resort to prevention of conception quite easily.

Poverty is the root-cause of immorality. The following passage from the essay read by Prof. Dr. Tondler before the Congress at Vienna in 1933 would show the evil consequences of insufficiency of living accommodation. The professor said, " On the average every family gets one room in Germany, two and a half rooms in France and three rooms in England. Seventy-five thousand families had no tenements of their own in Berlin in 1925. The result is that children sleep with the adults not only in the same room but also in the same bed. Many children lose their lives by the overcrowding in sanitary dwellings. Whole families are stricken with venereal diseases. Girls have to succumb to sexual intercourse even before they are mature. Sexual connections often take place between parents and their children and brothers and sisters. The boys learn to commit thefts and the girls become prostitutes. The same condition prevails at Vienna. In 1919, out of the tenements let out, 10 per cent. had only one small room; 37 per cent. had one big room and 23 per cent. had one small room and one big room. Out of the children between the ages of fourteen and eighteen who maintained themselves, twenty per cent. had no separate beds of their own. Towns and villages fare even worse."

In our country, the same condition prevails in cities like Bombay. A few

exceptions apart, it is observed that virtue is palsied where poverty prevails. Further on it will be shown how it is well-nigh impossible to uproot poverty without the aid of birth-control. The aphorism, *bubhukshitah kim na karoti papam*, is well known.

When we have thus realised that birth-control is the *sine qua-non* for every progress, we must consider the means to attain that end. To be satisfied with only that much of sexual enjoyment that is necessary for getting the desired number of children and to banish sexual thoughts from one's mind when progeny is not required, is one of the ways. The use of modern contraceptives is the other way. As for the first way, it must be remembered that while continence in the unmarried state may be possible, it is nothing but displaying ignorance about human nature to expect that young and healthy married couples, living together and fond of each other, can observe continence for years together. The cases of strong-willed persons, whose minds are not affected in the presence of objects of enjoyment, apart, there is no doubt that ordinary human beings are bound to fall a prey to the influence of enticements. Is it not strange, therefore, that this fact, which is as clear as daylight, is denied by some.

Self-control has been proved to be absolutely useless for birth-control from the experience of several countries and ages. Even the advocates of continence cannot claim that ordinary persons will be able to eschew sexual intercourse altogether throughout their lives. The laying aside of continence even for a single day every year may lead to an annual conception. Even, if we assume that self-control enables certain persons to bring about birth-control, we cannot draw the conclusion that others will be able to follow them. It is necessary to remember that just as appetite for food differs in the case of different persons, so sexual appetite also varies from person to person.

Strict observance of certain rules laid down in Hindu scriptures necessitates the neglect of the ideal of family-limitation. For instance, verse 5, Chapter 54, of " Vishnu Smriti " enjoins sexual intercourse on certain specified days.

Sir, honourable members have received a pamphlet written by Mrs. Sarojini Mehta, M.A., I am not going to read the whole pamphlet, but will quote only a few passages from it:

" Whenever the subject of birth-control is broached, the burden of our opponents' song is that continence (Brahmacharya) is the sovereign specific for our country and that it is better to leave Westerners to be blessed by their own artificial remedies. I humbly supplicate these honourable persons to state the grounds upon which they hold this view. It is stated that our people are spiritualistic, while Westerners are materialistic. It has now become well-nigh nauseating to hear this parrot cry repeated. In what way are our people

spiritualistic ? Have our people renounced the world and become ascetics ? Can mere repetition of certain catch-phrases like "All this is delusion." " One must abandon attachment to worldly life ", turn people into spiritualistic ? Does not every one of our villages possess Shylocks ready to demand their pound of flesh from poor and innocent debtors ? Are there not bankers mean enough to devour the deposits of widows? Have we not scoundrels who are debased enough to leave stranded helpless widows whom they themselves have misled ? Can we claim that our society is without men who have discarded their chaste and devoted wives and taken to prostitutes ? I am completely at a loss to understand how a society can be called spiritualistic, in which many are ruined by matrimonial transactions that amount to virtual sales of brides and bridegrooms, in which a person refusing to give an absenquial feast to his caste-people is out-casted, in which men are planning their second marriages while their first wives are burning on funeral pyres, in which even old fogies of sixty years can marry girls of twelve on the strength of monetary bribes and in which the treatment offered to widows is worse than that given even to the beasts. Western materialism cannot be held responsible for the rotten state of our society described above. On the contrary it is those who have come into contact with western materialism who are trying their best to remedy these evils, though their efforts are proving nothing but a cry in the wilderness."

Further on, in another paragraph, she says :

" The conduct of Indraraj towards Ahilya, of Parashar Rishi towards Satyawati and of Suryadev towards Kunti would make those perpetrators liable for rigorous imprisonment in this age of Kali but that being considered to be Satya Yug, we not only connive at these delinquencies but raise books containing such descriptions to the status of ' Sacred Books ' and insist that they must be prescribed as test-books in the curriculum for children. How many lessons on continence can pupils find in the Mahabharat, the Bhagwat and the Puranas ? How can an age, that never knew what continence was, inspire us to observe that virtue ? How is it possible to consider that age to have observed continence in which there were incidents like the story of King Dushyanta, who first misled an innocent and guileless girl living in the hermitage of a sage and then discarded her when she was pregnant ? When one considers the number of children born to certain persons mentioned in very ancient narratives, a doubt naturally arises in one's mind as to whether the people in those days ever dreamt what continence was. How can one believe that continence was observed in those times when one considers that Sagar begot sixty thousand sons and that there were a hundred Kowrawas, twenty-seven daughters of Daksha Prajapati and several other such instances ? Continence was paid scant respect in bygone days. It can actually be seen that in these

days it is kept at a distance everywhere. The birth-rate of our country is not falling lower than that of any ' materialistic ' country. Brahmacharya cannot be observed even where the life of a woman, already the mother of many children, is jeopardised by an additional delivery. It is neglected even in the families of paupers, dying of hunger, where the addition of even a single individual to the family would be nothing short of a calamity. Even in these days of unemployment, when it is practically impossible to find outlets for sons, additional children are born even in middle class families every year or year and a half. In castes, in which the usage of dowry prevails, parents express much grief at the birth of a daughter, kill her at the very outset or bring her up most negligently so that she may die a natural death. They, however, never resort to continence to avoid the chances of girls being born. In spite of all these instances we go on proclaiming that continence alone is the ideal for our country! Of what earthly use is such conduct ? We have to take into account the state of things actually existing before our eyes. There are no chances of making any improvement in our condition by mere talk of ideals."

Dr. K. B. Antrolikar: Sir, all that may be taken as read, because every member has received it.

Mr. P. J. Roham: Sir, I have made it clear that I am not going to read the whole of it. I request my honourable friend Dr. Antrolikar to have patience.

Mr. P. J. Roham: She continues :

" If, therefore, they have got the country's welfare at heart, they ought to try their level best to popularise continence by founding associations for the purpose of carrying on the work systematically, just as the birth-controllers are doing to popularise contraceptives. If, however, they are either unwilling or unable to do anything in this matter, the hands of the champions of contraception will be strengthened."

As a doctor has wisely remarked, if men had to bear the pangs which women have to undergo during child-birth none of them would ever consent to bear more than a single child in his life.

It is wrong to hold that because the ideal of large families is before society up to this time nobody wishes to limit his family. Human beings, who earnestly desire to be saddled with large families, are rare. Ordinary persons do want to limit their families and do not even flinch to have recourse to diabolical methods such as abortion, infanticide, etc. Such attempts are witnessed everywhere. From an account published by " The People's Tribune " in 1934 it is found that in 1933 over 24,000 dead bodies of little infants were picked up in the street of Shanghai alone and the same state prevails throughout most of China. It is bitter and terrible poverty that makes the parents expose their

infants. In the light of such instances, it is futile to hope that ordinary persons will be able to avoid progeny merely through self-control. It is, therefore, established that there is no go without recourse to modern contraceptives. To deny the necessity of those remedies is to show one's preference for abortions, infanticides, etc.

Some people think that they would be losers if the numbers in their particular race, religion, or region are lessened. They are afraid that their adversaries would thereby be enabled to gain ground over them. In the first place, it is necessary to remember in this connection that the rate of increase of a population does not necessarily dwindle down as soon as family limitation is resorted to. That rate is dependent not merely on the birth-rate but chiefly on the survival-rate. The experience of several scientists from different places has proved that the higher the birth-rate, the higher is the death-rate also and no sooner the birth goes down, the death-rate also declines. The result is that not only is the survival-rate not adversely affected but very often it even rises. Dr. Maria Stopes has found from the experience gained in " The Mothers' Clinic " that the greater the number of conceptions the higher is the rate of maternal and infantile mortality. Similar is the experience of other scientists. Dr. J. M. Munro, M.D., F.R.F.P.S., says in his book " Maternal Mortality and Morbidity ":

" The strongest argument in favour of limiting the family is that by the fourth birth the mortality-rate very nearly approaches that of the first birth, looked upon generally as the most serious and dangerous. After the fourth birth, the mortality rate steadily and markedly rises with each successive pregnancy and parturition. The same applies to still-births and neo-natal deaths."

Due to excessive child-mortality, the rate of growth of the population of countries like India is not equal to that of countries like England though the birth-rates in countries of the former type are higher than those in the latter type. The birth-rate of England is nearly half that of India. Yet we find that the population in England increased by nearly 23 per cent. between 1901 and 1931, while the population in India rose by only 17 per cent. in the same period. This will show that even for a rapid growth of numbers, the better way is to adopt the practice of birth-control and thus cut down infantile mortality.

It must also be remembered that for modern wars comparatively few persons are necessary. An army, well equipped with modern materials for warfare, can route an army much greater in number than itself, if the latter one is not so well-equipped. In the former world war, countries of low birth-rates vanquished those with high birth-rates.

In the world, we can witness many societies that are small in numbers but distinguished in respect of wealth, culture etc. In our country, the Parsees

community is an illustration on this point. To hanker after quantity is, therefore, not a very profitable ideal. The aphorism, *varameko guniputro na ch murkhashatanyapi*, is well known.

After this, it is worth while keeping in mind that it is principally poverty that is at the root of the animosity between different races, societies and countries. When poverty will be uprooted, the root-cause of much of such hatred will be eradicated and then nobody need be afraid of molestation from others.

The example of Western nations shows us that modern contraception is utilised by persons of all races, religions and strata. For instance, it is found that the notion that the Roman Catholics are against birth-control is unfounded. France is a Roman Catholic country and still it is notorious that the birth-rate in that country is quite low. The following ten countries had the lowest birth-rates in 1932 :—

| | | | | |
|-------------------|-----|-----|-----|------|
| Sweden | ... | ... | ... | 14-5 |
| Germany | ... | ... | ... | 15-1 |
| Austria | ... | ... | ... | 15-2 |
| England and Wales | ... | ... | ... | 15-3 |
| Norway | ... | ... | ... | 16-3 |
| Australia | ... | ... | ... | 16-4 |
| Switzerland | ... | ... | ... | 16-7 |
| New Zealand | ... | ... | ... | 17-1 |
| United States | ... | ... | ... | 17-3 |
| France | ... | ... | ... | 17-3 |

Among the three lowest countries are Austria, which is entirely Catholic, and Germany, which is one-third Catholic.

The following figures, the birth-rates of important cities, illustrate the very point.

They are all for 1927 or 1928:—

| | | | | |
|---------|-----|-----|-----|------|
| London | ... | ... | ... | 16-1 |
| Cologne | ... | ... | ... | 16-0 |
| Geneva | ... | ... | ... | 14-6 |
| Milan | ... | ... | ... | 14-5 |
| Turin | ... | ... | ... | 13-2 |
| Prague | ... | ... | ... | 12-5 |
| Munich | ... | ... | ... | 12-0 |
| Vienna | ... | ... | ... | 10-6 |

With the exception of London, all the above towns are solidly Roman Catholic, yet they all have a lower birth-rate than London. Three of them are in Mussolini's Italy.

It will be thus seen that the fear, that other communities will neglect birth-control

and will thus become stronger in numbers, is altogether a baseless one.

Speeches of statesmen, who are responsible for wars, clearly show that economic difficulties, due to pressure of population, are at the root of most of the modern wars, Bismarck, the Kaiser, Hitler, Mussolini and Goering have often stressed this point in no ambiguous words. For instance, Adolf Hitler says in his book, *Mein Kampf* :

" Through the mad multiplication of the German people before the war, the question of providing the necessary daily bread came in an ever sharper manner into the foreground of all political and economic thought and action." Further on he says :

" Only an adequate amount of room upon this earth secures to a nation the freedom of its existence—The National Socialist movement must endeavour to do away with the disproportion between our numbers and our territory Ground and territory must be the object of our foreign politics." (pp. 728-35).

In his recent historic speech, delivered on the 12th of September 1938, Hitler says:

"They expect Germany, where 140 persons are squeezed into a square kilometre, to keep her Jews, whereas the powers with only a few persons per kilometre do not want them"

Similarly Mussolini has said :

" We are hungry for land, because we are prolific and intend to remain so." (From " Foreign Affairs ", October 1926).

" Italy demands that her indisputable need of sun and land shall be recognised by all other nations. Should they fail to do so. Italy will be forced to take matters into her own hand." (From " Sunday Times ", November 14, 1926).

The Deputy Speaker: The honourable member has exceeded the time-limit.

Mr. B. K. Gaikwad: Sir, may I know what is the time-limit ?

The Deputy Speaker : Half-an-hour.

Mr. B. K. Gaikwad: On a point of information. Sir. The honourable member who moved the last resolution (Mr. Shrikant) spoke, I believe, for more than an hour.

The Deputy Speaker: Extension of the time is within the discretion of the Chair.

Mr. B. K. Gaikwad: Can that indulgence not be given to other resolutions ?

Mr. P. J. Roham: Sir, I do not wish to take much time of the House, but I have still some more points to make and request you to kindly allow me some more minutes.

It is, therefore, obvious that all those who stand for permanent world-brotherhood, must discountenance every attempt at increase of numbers and

must try their best to limit populations by means of birth-control.

The fear that birth-control propaganda will fail to filter down to the masses and the result of the movement will thus be dysgenic instead of eugenic, is also groundless. The experience gained in Western countries establishes the fact that the lower classes do take advantage of contraceptives as soon as they are made cognisant of them, the need being greater in their cases. The masses in our country, though illiterate, are intelligent enough to know in what their own interest lies and hence there is no doubt that they will fully utilise this invention also as soon as they are made aware of its existence. Vasectomy would be found to be useful in the case of such persons and hence Government and municipalities must provide facilities in this respect in their hospitals, etc.

The late principal Gole has clearly shown in his book that even villagers have many virtues and it is really they that replenish the supply of good citizens.

The opponents of this movement try to show its futility by pointing out the examples of France, Germany and Italy but they forget that we cannot follow these countries unless it is proved that their attempts at the increase of their populations are justified. In the first place, it must be kept in mind that the birth-rates of these nations are much lower than the birth-rate of our country. Our birth-rate is 35 whereas in 1936 the birth-rates of Italy, France and Germany were 22-2, 15 and 19 respectively. In 1900 the birth-rate in Germany was 35-6 but in 1933 it came down to 14-7. Italy and France also have their birth-rates much reduced since that time. In England the birth-rate was 33-9 in 1851-55 but in 1931 it was lowered to 15-3. Our birth-rate is practically stationary for the last fifty years and hence it would be unwise for us to imitate the efforts of other countries towards raising that rate.

It is quite natural for imperialists to lament the slackening of the rate of increase of the people of their race and it is not surprising that they should raise cries like " Renew or Die ". It is, however, strange to see that those cries should make even some educated persons suspicious about the benefits of birth-control. An article, " Renew or Die ", by Sir Leo Chiozza Money in " The Nineteenth Century and After " for February 1938 will illustrate the point. This writer has assumed that white leadership is necessary for the good of all humanity and has raised a cry to arrest the decline in the number of the white people. Now, in the first place, many will refuse to admit that white supremacy has benefitted the world and secondly few educated persons will be prepared to go to the length of maintaining that the decline in the number of white people will bring down any calamity upon humanity. Besides this, the postulates of this person are all wrong. He has taken it for granted that the birth-rate in England will gradually become lower and lower and that in the

year 2,035 the population of England will be reduced to 4,400,000 (44 lacs). But the facts are that the birth-rate in England is increasing instead of going down. In 1933 it was 14-4 but in July 1938 it becomes 15-3. Similarly whereas the writer has estimated that the population of England and Wales in 1940 would be only 40,700,000, the actual figure for 1937 there was already 41,031,000 and it is increasing at the rate of 190,000 people per year. These facts will show that one must take the precaution of not being misled by such articles.

Emigration is sometimes suggested as a remedy for finding an outlet to over-population but that remedy also is not very promising. Compulsion in emigration, amounting to transportation is out of question. Very few persons have the courage and the inclination necessary for leaving one's own country, endeared to one's heart by reminiscences of childhood and the presence of relatives and friends and made agreeable by a suitable climate and other factors and to repair to a distant land in which there is the danger of the climate being found to be an unsuitable one and in which the inhabitants are different from oneself in language, customs and manners. Generally, people willing to emigrate are those who are fit to be good citizens and who are able and energetic. It is really a loss to the motherland that such people should emigrate. These persons can easily maintain themselves in their own country but ambition impels them to try to better their lot by going to distant lands. Emigration is practically useless in the case of persons who are handicapped either physically or mentally or financially and it is really these people that stand in need of help. Considered from the point of the necessary capital alone, this remedy cannot **afford** relief to many persons.

Besides this, it must be kept in mind that sparsely populated countries are unwilling to accommodate others because they require elbow-room for their own increasing progeny. Canada is a colony in the British Empire mainly inhabited by Englishmen but it is notorious that the Canadians refused to allow English labourers, who had gone there for seasonal work, to settle in their land. Wars are occasioned by the attempts of populous countries to force their entrance in sparse regions. An illustration on the point, which is quite recent and near to us, is afforded by Burma. The cause underlying the recent communal riots there was mainly the suspicion in the minds of the Burmans that Indian marred their material progress. Compared: to over-populated countries, regions of sparse populations are very few, Japan, Italy, Germany, China, India and many other countries are over-populated. It is not possible to find adequate room for emigrants from all these lands..

One more point in this connection is also worth mentioning. Emigration cannot solve the population problem of a country permanently. Like air, expanding

population has a tendency to fill up vacuum immediately, leading to the recurrence of the former condition and hence it is obvious that there is no go without birth-control.

Some think that as soon as child-marriages are given up and late marriages are introduced, the increase in population will be checked. But this belief also is an unfounded one. In the first place, years must elapse before the ages at which girls are married would be sufficiently raised in our country. The years of greatest fertility in the case of girls are those between 18 and 22. In Western countries, women marry after this period. That is, they marry when their time of greatest fertility is over. When we notice the difficulties in the enforcement of the Sarda Act, fixing the minimum age of marriage of a girl at 14, we can easily see that it is almost useless to hope that in the near future women in our country will postpone their marriages up to 22 and population will be checked thereby. Mr. P. K. Wattal has drawn the following conclusions from the fertility-enquiry conducted specially in connection with the 1931 census.

- (1) That girls married at ages below twenty give birth to a smaller number of children than girls married at ages above twenty.
- (2) That the survival-rate of children born to mothers married at ages below twenty is much less than that of children born to mothers married at ages above twenty.

These conclusions show us that even when late marriages would come into vogue generally, there is no chance of population being appreciably checked thereby. More children would live upto mature ages and hence there is a chance of an increase and not a decrease in the rate of growth of our population.

Dr. G. S. Ghurye, Ph.D., University Professor of Sociology, Bombay, says in his article, " Fertility Data of the Indian Census of 1931 "in the" Journal of the University of Bombay" (Vol. III, May 1934) :—

" If the above tentative conclusion about the co-relation between fertility and the age of woman at marriage should prove to be correct, then with the increase in woman's age at marriage which is quite essential, there would be an increase in the fertility of marriage. As it is, I believe our population is very large and our increase undesirable and to help its increase at a greater rate would be suicidal. With our efforts to raise the women's age at marriage, therefore, there must also be carried on an intensive campaign for control of birth."

It must not, moreover, be forgotten that prostitution is encouraged by people being unable to marry at proper ages and other evil consequences also follow thereby. It is, therefore, necessary to resort to birth-control if marriage at a

proper age is aimed at.

The view is held that economic independence of women will lessen the growth of population but it also does not hold water. Economic independence has no power to free a person from the clutches of Eros. Few women can observe perfect continence throughout their lives and hence this remedy would be found to be fruitless. Even now, women of the lower classes are actually helping their families with their own earnings but that fact does not seem to help family-limitation to any extent.

Some persons hold the view that though birth-control may be necessarily on medical and hygienic grounds, still it is not required for solving economic difficulties. They maintain that our country has got much scope for economic and agricultural development and efforts in these directions would raise the standard of life of our people appreciably. On close examination, however, this view also is found to be quite untenable. Want of sufficient capital and rich customers would prevent any material development of our industries. Similarly, insufficiency of fertile lands, rain-fall and manures stand in the way of any substantial increase in our agricultural production. Except in Assam, there is very little fertile land that has not yet been brought under cultivation. In Burma, there is even now sufficient suitable land awaiting cultivation and it was the figure of such land from that province that misled certain people into the belief that India has even yet sufficient fertile virgin land. In our province, 86.4 per cent. of the cultivable land has already been brought under the plough and it is doubtful whether even a fraction of the rest of the land is of any value. According to the Report of the Royal Commission on Indian Agriculture much of such land is worthless. A great portion of the agricultural land in our country has become barren through incessant cropping and want of sufficient manures.

Through the excessive growth of population, our country suffers from deficiency of forests and pasture-lands. In Canada 34.3 per cent. of cultivable land is reserved for pasturage. This proportion is 21.5 in France, 18.3 in Italy, 14.3 in Germany but in our country it is only 1.6. These figures will show to what strait our cattle is forced. Cast our glance in whatever direction we may come across mere skeletons of cattle. Though our people pride themselves upon their humanitarianism, they have, in their struggle for land, unjustly deprived the dumb creatures of much of their pasturage and brought it under tillage. Our agriculture, therefore, is suffering from insufficiency of useful cattle and organic manures like cow-dung, and hence it is very difficult to effect many appreciable improvements in it. Some persons point out the large produce per acre of rice in Japan and China and hold out the hope that there is scope for materially increasing our produce of that crop. There are grounds, however, to

doubt the correctness of the figures of the production of rice in those countries. Count Karlo Sforra, former Minister for Foreign Affairs for Italy, contributed an article styled " The conflict between China and Japan " to a recent number of the " International Conciliation," a monthly published from New York. It is stated therein that from 1900, there is an appreciable decrease in the rice production per acre in Japan. There is considerable evidence to show that figures about agriculture in Japan are not reliable. Besides this, notice also must be taken of the facts that Japan is blessed with plenty of timely and all-the-year round rainfall and abundance of manures due to her extensive forests and also with a climate ideally suited to her rice crops; combination of advantages rarely witnessed anywhere else. Although it may be admitted that self-rule may effect some betterment of the lot of our masses, no lasting and appreciable improvement in the economic condition of our people can be hoped for unless the growth of our population is deliberately checked. As has been already explained, with every opportunity afforded for its expansion, population begins to grow rapidly and thus nullifies all the advantages secured through great efforts. Hence, experience has made many scientists to hold the view that unless precaution is taken to regulate population growth by means of birth-control along with efforts to improve the economic condition of the people there cannot be any substantial and permanent rise in the standard of life of the masses.

The fact, that mere self-rule is powerless to effect an all-round improvement in the condition of a people, is demonstrated to the hilt by the examples of many independent nations. Although, through various reasons, including a low birth-rate, the economic condition of the inhabitants of countries like England and America is superior to that obtaining in this country—poverty prevents many of our countrymen from obtaining a nourishing food—still it is far from satisfactory. Even there, many find it difficult to maintain a standard of life necessary for perfect health. According to President Roosevelt one-third of the inhabitants of America do not get sufficient nourishing food. One of the reasons for this is that even there birth-control is not practised to the extent to which it is necessary. There is plenty of fertile land per head in countries that are newly settled and hence the people there get more nourishing food than that obtained by persons in thickly populated nations. Here are the figures of consumption per head per annum in Australia and Italy :

| | <i>Australia</i> | <i>Italy</i> |
|-------------------------------|------------------|--------------|
| Milk and its products (gals.) | 102 | 23 |
| Meat (lbs.) | 202 | 35 |
| Fruit (lbs.) | 104 | 40 |
| Sugar (lbs.) | 107 | 18 |

| | | |
|--------------|-----|-----|
| Wheat (lbs.) | 297 | 351 |
|--------------|-----|-----|

Every article of food except wheat is consumed in far greater quantities in Australia than in Italy.

Out of the nations of the old world, countries like Holland that have their birth-rates much reduced through birth-control, are much happier than the rest.

In the Bombay Presidency, the amount of milk available per head per day is only one and a quarter " tolas ". According to authorities on nutrition, every individual must get on an average at least one pint of milk per day.

The main object of the movement for birth-control is to bring about a state of things wherein every country will have its birth-rate suitably reduced so that it would thus be able to maintain its population decently with the aid of its own produce.

Some are under the impression that modern scientific discoveries have solved the problems of food for mankind and that it is only mal-distribution that is at the root of the present economic difficulties. Fair distribution of property would, in their opinion, bring about plenty everywhere. There is no doubt that in many places injustice prevails in the division of property and every impartial public worker must take all steps to secure justice for wronged persons in this respect. It is, however, necessary to remember that mere equal distribution will never be able to bring about a permanent and material amelioration of the condition of the masses unless growth of population is controlled by means of family-limitation.

Land being the chief source of all wealth, there cannot be plenty for all unless plenty of fertile land falls to the share of each individual. Agricultural experts like Sir Damiel Hall and Prof. East have pointed out that about two and a half acres of cultivable land are needed to support one individual on the western European standard. But in all old countries, people have to maintain themselves on land much less than this. In India, there is only three quarters of an acre of cultivable land for each individual and, as has been already pointed out, according to the opinion of the Royal Commission on Agriculture, much of the uncultivated land in this country is practically useless.

The view that the advent of chemical fertilisers has solved the problem of manures is also not a sound one. Artificial manures cannot be used at each and every place. Rao Bahadur D. L. Sahastrabudhe, M.Ag., M.Sc., retired Agricultural Chemist to the Government of Bombay, wrote in his article in " Sahyadri " for October 1936 as follows :—

"Experience has shown that artificial manures cannot be utilised everywhere. Organic manures like cow-dung must accompany the use of

chemical fertilisers. Otherwise, artificial manures do not prove to be congenial to the crops. Similarly the crop that is to be manured with chemical fertilisers must have plentiful supply of water to prevent an injury to it.

Besides this, it must be noted that the two chief fertilisers are nitrates and phosphates and neither is of much use without the other. The supply of phosphates, however, is very limited. Sir Federick Keeble says :

'Nearly all the soil of the world are famishing for phosphates.' (Fertilisers and Food Production) (1932), p. 221. Professor Armstrong says:

'The solution of the nitrogen problem by Crookes has brought us nearer to destruction rather than saved us, by hastening the depletion of irreplaceable phosphatic stores.'"

Almost all places are suffering from inadequacy of forests and as a result thereof there is also a shortage of water and manures.

The present Congress Government are trying to uplift the masses of this Bombay Presidency (hear, hear). But all their efforts will go in vain if the population-problem is not tackled by means of birth-control.

The Deputy Speaker: The Honourable Member may now bring his remarks to a close.

Mr. P. J. Roham: Yes, Sir. Dr. Radhakamal Mukerjee has in his book, " Food Planning for 400 Millions ", states :

" Unless some check is placed upon population-growth, any other remedy tends to be only temporary, as in the latter country (China), for population will rapidly rise again to the maximum number of persons the land will support. As population outruns faster the educational facilities that may be provided, while the taxable capacity hardly increases, it is clear that the pressure of population cannot be viewed merely in relation to the food-supply. An expanding population makes readjustments more and more difficult. A rational family planning and education of the masses in birth-control, must be accepted as the most effective means of combating population-increase."

Bombay is the gateway of India and this movement also entered this country through that very gate. It would be in the fitness of things, therefore, that it should also be nurtured in this very province. Few people get an opportunity for doing acts that would immortalise their names. Birth-control movement has afforded such an opportunity to our provincial government and it is hoped that they will not let it slip but will fully utilise it to the benefit of themselves and the people.

APPENDIX II

QUESTIONS ASKED BY Dr. B. R. AMBEDKAR AND REPLIES GIVEN BY THE GOVERNMENT

Government Service: Selection Board

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar : Will Government be pleased to state— (a) whether there is any selection board constituted for the purpose of selecting candidates applying for the vacancies in the Provincial and Subordinate Services of the Government of Bombay; (b) if so, the names of the members who constitute that Board ?

The Honourable Sir Chunilal Mehta: No single Board exists for selecting candidates for the Provincial and Subordinate Services of the Government of Bombay. For certain of the Provincial Services selection committees have been constituted. Appointments to the Subordinate Services are made by the heads of offices under powers delegated to them or by the Local Government.

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Will the Honourable Member state whether he can give the names of the members of the Committees constituted for the Provincial Services ? He says that for certain of the Provincial Services selection committees have been formed.

The Honourable Sir Chunilal Mehta: I am afraid I cannot carry the names of the members in my head. If the honourable member gives notice, I shall supply the names. But I think there is not a fixed list of members of these committees; they change, I believe, every year or from time to time. (B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XIX, p. 325, dated 28th February 1927)

Acquisition and Improvement of Land for Village Sites

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Sir, I rise to a point of information. I do not exactly understand the object for which this amount is provided in the present budget. I should like to know from the Honourable Member in-charge whether it is expended for the purposes of establishing new settlements of villagers who are dissatisfied with their own village sites, or whether the amount is spent for providing amenities to the villagers, or for what purpose. There is certainly no information given either in the Blue Book or the White Book to enable new members like myself understand the exact purpose of this amount. I, therefore, hope that some enlightenment will be thrown on this subject. (B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XIX, p. 421, dated 1st March 1927)

Superintendents of Land Records

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Sir, I do not think that much argument need be wasted on this motion. The motion is based upon the ground that these superintendents who are provided in the budget at a cost of Rs. 35,800 do work which ordinarily in the course of things can be done and discharged by the deputy collectors. The only answer to this argument is that the deputy collectors are not in a position to do this work. The reply given by the honourable member, the Settlement Commissioner, does not seem to me to touch on that aspect of

the question. Nobody here in this House disputes that the work done by them is useful work necessary in the interest of society, but, Sir, the point and the important point is whether such work cannot be done by deputy collectors. If the reply to that is in the affirmative, then Government has no case at all, and I should like Government to clear that point in order to enable new members like me to decide one way or the other.

(B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XIX, p. 453, dated 3rd March 1927)

Deputy Collectorship: Application of Mr. M. K. Jadhav

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar : Will Government be pleased to state— (i) Whether Mr. M. K. Jadhav, B.A. (Hons.), Bombay, applied for one of the three posts of Deputy Collector recently filled up by the Revenue Department of the Government of Bombay ?

(ii) Whether they were aware that he belonged to the depressed classes ? (iii) The reasons why his application was rejected ?

Honourable Mr. J. L. Rieu: (i) Yes. (ii) Yes.

(iii) Government regret that they are not prepared to state the reasons why Mr. Jadhav or any other individual candidate was not selected.

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Did Government apply the rule of 50 per cent. reserved posts for depressed classes in Government service when filling up the appointments ?

The Honourable Mr. J. L. Rieu: The rule does not apply at all. It applies to clerical staff only.

Mr. W. S. Mukadam: Will Government be pleased to give us the names of the candidates selected ?

The Honourable Mr. J. L. Rieu: The honourable member will find it from records.

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Is the exclusion of Mr. Jadhav consistent with the policy of Government of encouraging the depressed classes ?

The Honourable Mr. J. L. Rieu: It is not inconsistent with it. (B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XIX, p. 545, dated 5th March 1927)

Admission of Depressed Classes to Public Places

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Will Government be pleased to state what steps they have taken to carry into effect Mr. Bole's resolution to throw open to the depressed classes all public places in this presidency ?

The Honourable Sir Ghulam Hussain: Attention is invited to the Press Note No. P-117, dated the 29th September 1923 (copy below for ready reference) issued by the Director of Information.

Press Note No. P-117, dated the 29th September 1923 (With the Compliments of the Director of Information, Bombay)

THE UNTOUCHABLE CLASSES

GOVERNMENT AND COUNCIL RESOLUTIONS

At the last session of the Bombay Legislative Council, on the motion of Mr. S. K.

Bole, a resolution was passed recommending that "the untouchable classes be allowed to use all public watering places, wells and dharamshalas which are built and maintained out of public funds or are administered by bodies appointed by Government or erected by Statutes as well as public schools, courts, offices and dispensaries."

In pursuance of this resolution Government have directed their officers to give effect to it as far as it relates to the public places and institutions belonging to and maintained by Government. The Collectors have been requested to advise the local public bodies to consider the desirability of accepting the recommendation made in the resolution. The Bombay and Karachi Port Trusts, the Bombay City Improvement Trust and the Municipal Corporation have also been requested to give effect to the resolution with regard to the places under their control.

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar : Is the honourable member aware that the depressed classes in several places are prevented from taking advantage of the public places provided by the public bodies, by the ordinary villagers in the villages ?

The Honourable Sir Ghulam Hussain: Not to my knowledge.

(B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XIX, p. 546, dated 5th March 1927)

Assistant Educational Inspector for Depressed Classes

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Will Government be pleased to state— (i) Why Mr. G. G. Kamble was reduced from his post of Extra Assistant Educational Inspector for the Depressed Classes ? (ii) Whether the said post has been abolished ? (iii) If so, why ?

The Honourable Dewan Bahadur Harilal D. Desai: (i) Mr. Kamble was reverted because he failed to justify his existence, there being no real improvement in the schools placed under his charge. (ii) Yes.

(iii) The post was abolished because the control of primary schools having been transferred to the local authorities under the Bombay Primary Education Act, 1923, there was no longer any necessity for Government to continue to maintain it.

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Does not Government think it necessary that the benefit of a special assistant educational inspector should be extended to the depressed classes schools ?

The Honourable Dewan Bahadur Harilal D. Desai: In the first instance, Government created the special post. The schools have now been transferred

to the local bodies, and if Government find it necessary to make such an appointment, they will consider the matter. (B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XIX, p. 604, dated 7th March 1927)

Judgements of Mr. Fleming, City Magistrate

Dr. B. R. Ambedkur: Will Government be pleased to state— (a) whether their attention has been drawn to the judgements delivered by Mr. Fleming, City Magistrate, Poona, in the two recent criminal cases (i) Emperor v. Baburao Fule and (ii) Emperor v. Javalkar and others in both of which the accused were charged under section 500 of the Indian Penal Code;

(b) whether they are aware that Mr. Fleming has delivered contradictory judgements on a common point of law involved in both the cases, viz., whether the complainant is an aggrieved person within the meaning of section 198 of the Criminal Procedure Code;

(c) whether they have called for an explanation from Mr. Fleming as to why he delivered such contradictory judgements;

(d) whether they propose to take any steps against Mr. Fleming in this connection?

The Honourable Mr. J. E. B. Hotson: (a) to (d) The remedies provided by the law are open to any person who considers himself aggrieved by a magistrate's judgement. Government could not without gross impropriety express an opinion in this House on the points to which this question refers.

Mr. S. K. Bole: The answer is given only to (b) and not to (a), (c) or (d).

The Honourable Mr. J. E. B. Hotson: The answer is to all four parts of the question.

Mr. S. K. Bole : The question in (a) is " whether their attention is drawn to the judgements delivered by Mr. Fleming " but there is no answer to that.

The Honourable Mr. J. E. B. Hotson: I think, it is implied. The attention of Government has been drawn to them.

Mr. S. K. Bole: Again, in (b) the question is " whether they are aware that Mr. Fleming has delivered contradictory judgements " but there is no answer to that.

The Honourable Mr. J. E. B. Hotson: Yes, the reply is there, " Government could not without gross impropriety express an opinion in this House " etc.

Mr. S. K. Bole: What is asked is whether they are aware.

The Honourable the President: The word "contradictory" implies and asks for opinion, and therefore that reply.

(B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XIX, p. 1147, dated 16th March 1927)

Assault by Mulki Patil on a Mahar (Chikhardi)

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar : Will Government be pleased to state— (a) whether it is a

fact that the Mulki Patil of the village Chikhardi in the Sholapur District committed an assault on Arjuna Lala Mahar for refusing to do his private work and fractured his skull;

(b) whether it is a fact that Arjuna is now being treated for his injury at the Civil Hospital, Barsi;

(c) if so, what steps they have taken against the Patil ?

The Honourable Mr. J. L. Rieu: The information has been called for.

(B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XIX, p. 1147, dated 16th March 1927)

Harassment of Mahars (Sholapur)

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar : Will Government be pleased to state— (a) whether it is a fact that the Gaonkaris of the villages of (i) Ralerass, (ii) Pangaon, (iii) Pangri, (iv) Uple Dumala, (v) Ambegaon and (vi) Surdi in the District of Sholapur have been acting in conspiracy to stop the ryots and shop-keepers of their respective villages from having any dealings with the Mahars of their villages and have assaulted the Mahars of their villages and have in some cases outraged the modesty of the Mahar women and have gone to the length of throwing filth in the water-courses used by the Mahars because the Mahars in these villages have in their efforts at self-improvement given up the carrying of the carcasses of dead animals ;

(b) what steps they propose to take to protect the Mahars from such tyranny.

The Honourable Mr. J. E. B. Hotson : The information is being obtained.

(B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XIX, p. 1298, dated 17th March 1927)

Accident on the Ulhas River

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar : Will Government be pleased to state— (a) whether their attention has been drawn to the leading article published in the *Pratiyogi*, dated the 13th February 1926, and the extracts of statements of the people of Badlapur published in the *Pratiyogi*, dated the 12th June 1926;

(b) if so, whether they still withhold the permission to prosecute as asked for ?

The Honourable Sir Cowasji Jehangir: (a) Government have noticed a summary of the article published in the *Pratiyogi*, dated the 13th February 1926, but not the extracts of statements of the people of Badlapur published in the issue of the paper of 12th June 1926. (b) Yes.

(B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XX, p. 759, dated 27th July 1927)

Public Service: Depressed Classes

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Will Government be pleased to give the following information regarding the strength of the depressed classes in the public service:—

| | | | | | |
|--|--|--------|----|-----------|---------|
| | | Number | of | Depressed | Classes |
|--|--|--------|----|-----------|---------|

| | | | |
|----------|------------|----------|--------------|
| District | Department | employed | |
| | | As peons | On the staff |

The Honourable Sir Chunilal Mehta: The information has been called for. (B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XX, p. 847, dated 27th July 1927)

Watandar Mahars: Remuneration

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Will Government be pleased to give the following information for each village in the Presidency:—

| Village | Total Population | No. of Offending Mahars | Remuneration to officiating Mahars estimated from all sources in Rupees | | | Total Remuneration |
|---------|------------------|-------------------------|---|-------------|-------------------|--------------------|
| | | | From Inam land | From Baluta | Government Salary | |

The Honourable Mr. J. L. Rieu: As the time and trouble involved in obtaining the information would be out of all proportions to its possible utility from the public point of view. Government regret that they are not prepared to collect it. If the Honourable Member will select a small number of typical villages for this enquiry. Government will consider whether it is practicable to supply the information he desires in regard to them.

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: It is not a fact that the information asked for in this question is obtainable from the watan proceedings of every village ?

The Honourable Mr. J. L. Rieu : In any case I would call the honourable member's attention to the fact that this question would have to be sent to every village in the Bombay Presidency. The labour and time involved in collecting this information would be enormous. (B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XX, p. 1065, dated 27th July 1927)

Officiating Watandar Mahars

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar : Will Government be pleased to state— (a) whether there are any rules governing the number of the officiating Watandar Mahars in the villages in the different parts of the presidency ? (Jb) if so, whether they will publish them or refer to them ?

The Honourable Mr. J. L. Rieu: (a) and (b) There are no rules on the subject. The appointment of officiating Watandar Mahars is governed by the provisions of section 64 of the Bombay Hereditary Offices Act.

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Is the Honourable Member aware that discretion is left to the Collector under section 64 in exercise of which he can make rules

regarding officiating Watandar Mahars ?

The Honourable Mr. J. L. Rieu: I am aware of that.

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Is the honourable member aware that in a certain village 16 Mahars are officiating as Watandars ?

The Honourable Mr. J. L. Rieu: If the honourable member gives notice I will make enquiries.

(B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XX, p. 1207, dated 27th July 1927)

Bridge on the Ulhas River at Badlapur

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar : Will Government be pleased to state—

(a) whether the consideration of the question of constructing a low level causeway on the river Ulhas at Badlapur in the Thana District has not yet been finished;

(b) whether the whole correspondence including the Commissioner's and the Collector's reports thereon would be placed on the Council Table ;

(c) whether they are aware that a high level bridge instead of a low level causeway is absolutely necessary ?

The Honourable Mr. J. L. Rieu: (a) No. But it is hoped that a conclusion will soon be reached.

(b) Government are not prepared to place the correspondence on the table.

(c) No.

(B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XX, p. 1472, dated 27th July 1927)

Forest Land for Cultivation: Grants to Depressed Classes

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Will Government be pleased to state— (a) the total extent of forest land given for cultivation in each district of this Presidency in the years 1923, 1924, 1925 and 1926; (b) how much of this was given to the Depressed Classes in each district in the years mentioned ?

Honourable Mr. G. B. Pradhan : (a and b) A statement furnishing the required information is placed on the Council Table. The area shown in the statement is for each forest division of the presidency.

Statement of forest land given out for cultivation during 1923,1924,1925 and 1926

| Forest Division | Total extent of forest land given out for cultivation | | | |
|-----------------|---|-------|-------|-------|
| | 1923 | 1924 | 1925 | 1926 |
| Northern Circle | Acres | Acres | Acres | Acres |
| 1 Panch Mahals | 660 | 7,536 | | 9 |
| 2 Surat .. | 1,175 | 1,152 | 3,558 | |

| | | | | |
|-----------------------------|--------|-------|-------|-------|
| 3 North Thana | 191 | 171 | | 5 |
| 4 West Thana | 339 | 330 | 295 | |
| 5 East Thana | 21,463 | 2,237 | 2,810 | 3,733 |
| 6 West Nasik | 3,080 | 432 | 1,817 | 256 |
| 7 East Nasik | 8,493 | 2,714 | 2,100 | 2,482 |
| Central Circle | | | | |
| 1 East Khandesh . . | 186 | 401 | 1,756 | 1,872 |
| 2 North Khandesh .. | | 1,325 | 1,660 | 1,815 |
| 3 West Khandesh .. | 90 | 51 | 235 | 560 |
| 4 Poona | 1 | 1 | 70 | 36 |
| 5 Ahmednagar | 4,254 | 55 | 86 | 88 |
| 6 Satara | 3,516 | 252 | 473 | 285 |
| Southern Circle | | | | |
| 1 Northern Division, Kanara | 22 | | | 7 |
| 2 Eastern Division, Kanara | 105 | 137 | 33 | 7 |
| 3 Southern Division, Kanara | 26 | 40 | 31 | 37 |
| 4 Western Division, Kanara | .133 | 70 | 59 | 5 |
| 5 Central Division, Kanara | 13 | 6 | 1 | |
| 6 Belgaum | 668 | 719 | 2,006 | 2,717 |
| 7 Dharwar | 346 | 25 | 154 | 132 |
| Sind Circle | | | | |
| 1 Sukkur | 1,841 | 2,577 | 1,330 | 1,888 |
| 2 Shikapur | 1,399 | 1,256 | 1,066 | 928 |
| 3 Larkana | 4,321 | 3,143 | 4,838 | 5,300 |
| 4 Hyderabad | 549 | 1,782 | 2,071 | 2,396 |
| 5 Karachi | 92 | 1,093 | 1,789 | 3,084 |

| | | | | | |
|---|-----------------|--------|-------|-------|-------|
| | Northern Circle | | | | |
| 1 | Panch Mahals | 227 | 1,446 | | 9 |
| 2 | Surat | 1,175 | 1,152 | 3,558 | |
| 3 | North Thana | 191 | 171 | | 5 |
| 4 | West Thana | 339 | 330 | 295 | |
| 5 | East Thana | 21,463 | 2,237 | 2,810 | 3,733 |
| 6 | West Nasik | 2,927 | 411 | 1,727 | 243 |
| 7 | East Nasik | 8,493 | 2,714 | 2,100 | 2,482 |
| | Central Circle | | | | |
| 1 | East Khandesh | | 30 | 91 | 101 |

| | | | | | | |
|---|------------------------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---|
| 2 | North Khandesh | | 1,325 | 1,660 | 1,815 | |
| 3 | West Khandesh .. | .. 40 | 37 | 90 | 340 | |
| 4 | Poona | | | | | |
| 5 | Ahmednagar | 55 | | | | |
| 6 | Satara | | | | | |
| | Southern Circle | | | | | |
| 1 | Northern Division, Kanara | | | | | No applications were received from persons of Depressed Classes during these years. |
| 2 | Eastern Division, Kanara | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| 3 | Southern Division, Kanara | . 20 | 38 | 28 | 36 | |
| 4 | Western Division, Kanara | | | | | No applications were received from persons of Depressed Classes during these years |
| 5 | Central Division, Kanara | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| 6 | Belgaum | . 45 | 104 | 23 | 364 | |
| 7 | Dharwar | | | | | Do. |
| | Sind Circle | | | | | |
| 1 | Sukkur | | | | | There are no Depressed Classes in Sind who do agricultural |
| 2 | Shikapur | | | | | |
| 3 | Larkana | | | | | |
| 4 | Hyderabad | | | | | |
| 5 | Karachi | | | | | |

| | | | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|-------|
| | | | | | | work. |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|-------|

(B.T..C. Debates. Vol. XX. pp. 1472-74, dated 27th July 1927)

Tobacco Licence

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar : Will Government be pleased to state— (a) whether one Narayan Sakharam had applied to the Superintendent of Excise, Tobacco Department, for licence to sell tobacco;

(b) whether his application was refused although the applicant was a military pensioner and was recommended for licence by the Officer Commanding the 117th Rajputs; (c) the reasons why his application was refused;

(d) whether the application was refused on account of the fact that the applicant belonged to the depressed classes;

(e) whether they make any caste discrimination in the matter of issuing licences?

The Honourable Mr. J. L. Rieu: (a) Yes. (b) Yes.

(c) Tobacco licences are only granted to persons in really indigent circumstances who are unable to earn a livelihood by any other means. The person referred to by the honourable member was reported to be quite fit to earn his livelihood in other ways. He was therefore refused a licence. (d) No. (e) No.

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Is this in accordance with the rules laid down by the department in the matter of tobacco licences ?

The Honourable Mr. J. L. Rieu: I do not think that there are any specific rules on the subject, but that is the practice.

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: May I know whether this particular question refers to the honourable member's department or to the department under the Excise Minister ?

The Honourable Mr. J. L. Rieu: This refers to the Revenue Department. Tobacco licences are given out by the Collector of Bombay. (B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XXI, p. 57, dated 29th September 1927) Forest Lands, Nasik: Applications of Mahars

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar : Will Government be pleased to state— (a) whether they are aware that the Mahars of the village of Pimplad in taluka Nasik had applied to the Collector for forest land;

(b) whether they had asked for survey number 220 in the village of Pimplad;

(c) whether, that being refused, they had asked for survey number 202 in the village of Rajur-Babula ;

(d) whether, that being refused they had asked for survey number 71 in the village of Rajur-Babula;

(c) whether it is a fact that even this last application has been rejected; (f) the reasons for this persistent refusal to consider favourably the applications of these Mahars ?

The Honourable Mr. G. B. Pradhan: (a), (b), (c), (d) and (e) Yes, as it had already been granted to another individual.

(2) Survey No. 202 of Rajur is pasture forest incharge of the Revenue Department. It is sold annually for grazing to the villagers, and it cannot be granted for any other purpose, as the remaining grazing area available in the village is not sufficient for their requirements.

(3) For the same reason Survey No. 71 of Rajur-Babula which is assigned for Kuran (grazing ground) could not be granted to the Mahars.

I may add that 11 survey numbers of Pimplad and Rajur-Babula comprising of nearly 200 acres of land were the only lands available for being given out for cultivation. They were therefore put to sale at an upset price 12 times the assessment and it was ordered that none but the Mahars, Bhils and Kolis should bid. The condition was imposed specially to exclude unfair competition by moneyed people. The papers of the sales recently sanctioned show that two Kolis and three Mahars of Pimplad and one Koli and three Mahars of Rajur-Babula are the purchasers. (B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XXI, p. 219, dated 1st October 1927)

Grazing Grounds, Thana District

Dr. P. G. Solanki on behalf of Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Will Government be pleased to state—

(a) whether their attention has been drawn to the information published on pages 372 and 417 of the Vividha Jnana Vistar of the year 1926;

(b) if so, whether they intend to take steps to order such varkas or grass lands to be free from assessment;

(c) whether they intend to let open the forest lands of the village of Badlapur in the Thana District for agricultural and grazing purposes as the income from those forest lands is comparatively very small ?

The Honourable Mr. J. L. Rieu : (a) Only when the Honourable Member gave notice of this question.

(b) No.

(c) No.

(B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XXI, pp. 269-70, dated 1st October 1927)

Forest Lands for Depressed Classes

Dr. P. G. Solanki on behalf of Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Will Government be pleased to state—

- (a) whether they are aware of the enormous extent of unemployment prevailing among the depressed classes;
- (b) whether in view of the fact that many occupations are closed to the depressed classes owing to the system of untouchability, they intend to consider the question of forming settlements of the depressed classes wherever tracts of forests lands are available as has been done by the Mysore Government;
- (c) whether they intend to give preferential treatment to applicants from the depressed classes for forest lands ?

The Honourable Mr. G. B. Pradhan: (a) No.

- (b) Such settlements have already been formed in the three Khandesh Divisions, and the feasibility of forming further settlements will be considered if applications are made and suitable lands in forests are available.
- (c) Application from depressed classes for forest lands will be favourably considered, but no promise of preferential treatment can be held out. (B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XXI, pp. 269-70, dated 1st October 1927)

Deccan Agriculturists' Relief Act: Repeal

- Dr. B. R. Ambedkar :* Will Government be pleased to state— (a) whether it is a fact that they are contemplating the introduction of a bill to repeal the Deccan Agriculturists' Relief Act;
- (b) if so, whether they have ascertained the views of the agricultural population whose interests are bound to be affected by such a step;
 - (c) whether they are aware that the Royal Commission on Agriculture has expressed the opinion that the operation of the Usurious Loans Act, 1918, has not been successful ?

The Honourable Mr. J. R. Martin : (a) and (b) The question of amending or repealing the Deccan Agriculturists' Relief Act has been postponed till the question of legislation in connection with agricultural indebtedness recommended by the Royal Agricultural Commission can be taken up as a whole. (c) Yes. (B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XXIV, p. 287, dated 29th September 1928)

Government Servants: Salaries and Pensions

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Will Government be pleased to state the total amount they paid out in 1927-28 (or any other year previous to it for which figures are available)—

- (i) as salaries to their permanent servant in the subordinate and clerical services;
- (ii) as pensions to servants who were in their subordinate and clerical services ?

The Honourable Mr. G. B. Pradhan: (i) Figures of the cost of permanent and

temporary establishments are not separately available. The total amount expended by the Provincial Government during 1925-26 on the salaries of their subordinate establishments was Rs. 296 lakhs excluding the cost (amounting to about Rs. 25 lakhs) of the menial establishments.

(ii) Government regret that they are unable to furnish the information asked for as separate figures for different classes of establishments are not readily available. (B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XXIV, p. 287, dated 29th September 1928)

Government Servants: Starting Pay of Graduates

Dr. P. G. Solanki on behalf of Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Will Government be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that Mr. S. K. Bole had put a question in the Council asking for information about the starting pay of Graduates in the City of Bombay;

(b) whether it is a fact that Government replied that Graduates were started on Rs. 90 except those serving in the Lower Grade in those offices, where the establishments are divided into " Upper and Lower Grades," and that Government issued Government Resolution, Finance Department, No. 1140, dated 25th March 1925 directing the Heads of Departments accordingly;

(c) whether it is a fact that inspite of the above mentioned Government Resolution directing the Heads of Departments to start Graduates on Rs. 90 in the City of Bombay, the Collector of Bombay starts Graduates on Rs. 60 only in the departments under him, even though there are no Upper and Lower Grades in those departments;

(d) whether Government are aware that Graduates start on Rs. 70 in the mofussil ?

The Honourable Mr. G. B. Pradhan: (a) Yes.

(b) Government replied that all Heads of Offices in Bombay were authorised to pay an initial salary of Rs. 90 to all graduates except those in the Lower Division in those offices in which the establishment is divided into Upper and Lower Divisions. Orders to the above effect were issued in Government Resolution, Finance Department, No. 1140, dated 25th March 1925.

(c) Under the orders referred to by the Honourable Member Government have authorised their Heads of Offices to start graduates, except those in the Lower Division in those offices in which the establishment is divided into Upper and Lower Divisions, on an initial pay of Rs. 90 per mensem in the revised time scale. According to the above orders the Collector of Bombay gives an initial pay of Rs. 90 per mensem to a graduate where he thinks that a graduate clerk is absolutely necessary whereas in other cases graduates are given rates of pay ranging from Rs. 60 to Rs. 90 according to the importance of the work

assigned to them. (d) Yes.

(B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XXV, p. 685, dated 28th February 1929)

Land Acquisition : Mulshi Dam

Dr. P. G. Solanki on behalf of Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Will Government be pleased to state—

(a) whether the lands of the Mahars of Mohari and Wadgaon, taluka Haveli, district Poona, were acquired by Government on account of the Mulshi dam;

(b) the rates at which the lands were acquired;

(c) whether the price of the lands was paid to the Mahars of these villages ?

The Honourable Mr. J. L. Rieu: (a) Yes.

(b) Rs. 50 per acre for Jirait land and Rs. 550 per acre for Gadi (rice) lands.

(c) The lands being service inam, the sums awarded were credited to Government and an annual cash allowance calculated at 5 per cent. of the total amount of the compensation was sanctioned for the watandar Mahars.

(B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XXV, p. 767, dated 1st March 1927)

Grants-in-aid to Local Boards

Dr. P. G. Solanki on behalf of Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Will Government be pleased to state—

(a) whether it is a fact that the question of grants to Local Boards has been kept pending for nearly 3 years by the Director of Public Instruction; (b) if so, who is responsible for the delay;

(c) what steps, if any. Government propose to take in the matter ?

The Honourable Moulvi Rafiuddin Ahmed: (a) If the honourable member refers to grants by Government on account of primary education the provisional grants made yearly to district local boards or local authorities are often in excess of the actual amount shown to be due after audit. The final adjustment of these yearly grants are made later when audit objections have been met. (b) Does not arise.

(c) No alteration of the existing procedure is contemplated. (B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XXV, p. 1092, dated 7th March 1929)

Bombay Municipal Corporation—Morland Road

Dr. B. R. Ambedkar: Will Government be pleased to state—(a) whether it is a fact that the Bombay Municipal Corporation has not completely re-constructed Morland Road even once during the last 15 years, and, if so, the reasons therefor ;

(b) whether Government intend to take any steps in the matter; (c) whether it is a fact that the matter was represented to the Police Authorities and to the Municipal Corporation through representations and in the Press ?

The Honourable Dewan Bahadur Harilal D. Desai: (a) It is not a fact that the

road has not been repaired during the last 15 years. During the period 1914 to 1921 the whole road was repaired regularly and in 1920-21 the entire length was repaired and the surface dressed with a paint coat of tar at a cost of Rs. 11,640-15-3. Since 1922 substantial repairs have not been carried out, but extensive patching of the road surface has been frequently done. The Corporation has given its consent to the re-construction of the road with sheet asphalt on cement concrete foundations and the work will be taken in hand in due course.

(b) No.

(c) Complaints have been made to the Corporation.

(B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XXV. p. 1092, dated 7th March 1929)

Secondary Schools; Grants-in-aid

Dr. P. G. Solanki for Dr. B. R. Ambedkar : Will Government be pleased to state—

(a) the reasons why the question of reorganising the basis of assessing annual grants to Secondary Schools was not considered last year;

(b) whether there are any schools in the Presidency that have deserved special consideration from Government in point of receiving regular grants-in-aid ;

(c) whether in assessing grants to Secondary Schools the Director of Public Instruction is invariably guided by the inspection reports of the Educational Inspectors ? If not, what is generally his standard of distributing annual grants to Secondary Schools ;

(d) whether the Educational Department observe, in order to maintain the departmental standard of efficiency, some basis on which the aided Schools are expected to spend per capita annually, and the Government on the other hand are expected to share the corresponding cost ? If so, what is the minimum ratio between the cost to the Government and the institution according to the basis ;

(e) the minimum number of years after which a Secondary School is given registration by the Education Department;

(f) the number of Secondary Schools of over 5 years' standing that have not yet been permanently registered for grant-in-aid ?

The Honourable Moulvi Rafiuddin Ahmed: (a) Government were generally satisfied that the basis on which grants to Secondary Schools are assessed is sound. (b) Yes.

(c) Grants are assessed according to the principles laid down in the Grant-in-aid Code. In framing his estimate of the extent to which a particular school satisfies the requirements of the Grant-in-aid Code, the Director of Public Instruction is invariably guided by the reports of the Inspecting staff. The

question in the latter portion does not therefore arise.

- (d) No definite standard of expenditure per capita is observed in assessing expenditure for grant. The system laid down in the Grant-in-aid Code provides for grants at the rate of one-third of the admitted expenditure being given to all schools which satisfy the requirements, subject to the funds allotted for the purpose permitting.
- (e) No minimum number of years is prescribed. Owing to lack of funds the registration of additional schools has been suspended. (f) About 110 schools. (B.L.C. Debates, Vol. XXVIII, pp. 585-86, dated 27th February 1980)

APPENDIX III UNIVERSITY REFORMS COMMITTEE

(Refer Chapter 7, page 48)

*QUESTIONNAIRE

OF UNIVERSITY REFORM IN BOMBAY PRESIDENCY

(The Bombay Government appointed a Committee to look into the problem of reform of the Bombay University. This Committee consisted of 13 members with Sir Chimanlal H. Setalvad, Kt. as its Chairman. Dr. Ambedkar was not a member of this committee but he was one of the 321 persons to whom the committee sent its questionnaire of 54 questions. Dr. Ambedkar replied only some of the questions which he considered worth replying. The questions replied by Dr. Ambedkar are alone reproduced here to be followed by his evidence.—*Editor.*)

1. What in your opinion should be the aim and function of University education in the Bombay Presidency ? Do you consider that the existing system of University education in this Presidency affords the young Indians of this Presidency adequate opportunities of attaining this aim ? If not, in what main respects do you consider the existing system deficient ?
2. Do you consider that the defects pointed out by you mainly lie in or spring from (a) the spirit and methods of instructor or pupil; (b) the conditions of education, antecedent to the students' entrance of the University; or (c) the administrative or educational machinery of the University ?
3. How far in your opinion has the University promoted knowledge of, and mutual interest? in and sympathy for, the history and culture of the different communities in this Presidency ? Can you suggest means by which this can be further promoted ?

II. Secondary and Intermediate Education (Questions 4-7)

4. Do you consider the training and attainments of students coming out of our High Schools sufficient preparation for entering upon University education ? If you consider this preparation inadequate, have you any suggestions for the improvement of the present conditions ?
5. Do you consider the creation in this Presidency of (a) a new set of institutions in intermediate between High Schools and University; (b) a new Board of Secondary and Intermediate Education such as was proposed by the Calcutta University Commission necessary or desirable ? If so, how should such institutions and such a Board be constituted and financed ?
6. If you consider intermediate institutions, with or without an Intermediate Board, unnecessary or undesirable, how without them could the level, range and effectiveness of existing High School education in this Presidency be improved ?
7. How may the University best secure the maintenance of efficiency in the institutions that send students to it for admission ?

III. Functions of the University of Bombay (Questions 8-24)

(a) Teaching (Questions 8-13)

8. In what directions is it necessary and practicable as well as advisable, in your judgement, to extend the function of the University of Bombay so as to make it predominantly a teaching University ?
9. Do you consider that the University should, in addition to postgraduate teaching take any direct part in under-graduate teaching ? If so, how would you reconcile and co-ordinate the teaching functions of the University with those of the existing teaching institutions ?
10. If you do not consider the University should take any direct part in under-graduate teaching, how by proper co-ordination would you utilise to the best advantage the existing facilities for under-graduate study ?

IV. Additional University in Bombay Presidency (Questions 25-30)

25. Is it desirable to constitute any additional Universities within the Bombay Presidency ? What Centres of higher education in the Presidency do you consider—
(a) ripe for immediate expansion into Universities, (b) likely to be ripe in the near future, and on what grounds ?
28. How would the institution of additional Universities affect the existing University of Bombay ? How would you secure co-operation, co-ordination, and reciprocity between the University of Bombay and the new University ? What arrangement do you suggest for the period of transition ?

VII. Constitution (Questions 36-40)

36. What defects do you find in the constitutional machinery of the University of

Bombay ?

37. What should be the strength, composition, duration of office, method of constituting and powers and functions of the Senate ? Who, if any, should be *ex-officio*, life, and nominated members of the Senate ? How does your method of constituting the Senate secure the representation of all interests and communities ?
38. Do you consider that it is necessary or desirable to decentralise the powers and functions hitherto exercised by the Syndicate of the Bombay University ? If so, what powers or functions would you remove from the Syndicate and to what new or existing bodies of the University would you assign them ? How should the Syndicate so reorganised and any new bodies you may propose be composed ?
39. What functions and powers would you assign to the Faculties and Boards of Studies ? How should these bodies be constituted and appointed ?

III. Functions of the University of Bombay (Questions 8-24)

(c) *Prescribing Courses and Examining* (Questions 16-19)

16. How in your opinion has the University been discharging the functions of (a) conducting examinations, (b) prescribing courses of study, and (c) appointing text-books ? Would you suggest any modifications in the exercise of these functions ?
17. How far can University examinations be profitably replaced or supplemented by other means of testing proficiency, intelligence and competence ?
18. On what branches of study should the Bombay University undertake the teaching immediately and in the near future ?
19. In considering the extension of the teaching functions of the University of Bombay and bearing in mind the special requirements of the people of Bombay, would you suggest the institution of any more faculties e.g. of Fine Arts or Technology so as to make the scope of the University broader, more liberal and more comprehensive ? (d) *Post-Graduate Courses and Degrees* (Questions 20-21)
20. When the Bombay University further develops its teaching functions, what should be the duration of studies for post-graduate degrees ? How would you award such degrees, whether by examination, thesis, original research or a combination of one or more of these ?
21. Do you wish to institute any new degrees *honoris causa* and, if so, on what grounds would you have them awarded ? (c) *Promoting Research* (Questions 22-23).
22. How can the University best encourage and guide independent investigation of Indian and especially Bombay's problems, whether historical, economic,

sociological, industrial, or other ?

23. Is there any need for the creation of a University Press and Publication Department ? How might such Department be organised and financed ? (f) *Appointing University Teachers* (Question 24)
24. In a Bombay Teaching University what should be the method of selecting and appointing University Professors, Readers, Lecturers etc. ? What qualifications are requisite in them ? What range of salaries do they require ? What should be the conditions regulating their appointment and tenure of office ?

IV. Additional Universities in Bombay Presidency (Questions 25-30)

30. What principles or policy should be followed by (a) the Bombay University, (b) any new University within this Presidency in permitting the opening of any new College or Institution, constituent or affiliated ?

V. Relation of the University and the Public (Questions 31-34)

31. How far do you consider the curricula of the Bombay University satisfy the needs of Agricultural, Industrial, Professional and Public-life in the Presidency, and especially in the City of Bombay ?
32. Can you suggest method of promoting cordial relation and co-operation between the University and other public bodies whether industrial, commercial, professional, municipal or Government ?
33. What measures should be taken to bring the University and its working into closer relation with the industrial and commercial life and interests of the City ?
34. What should be the extent and purpose of the University's contribution to the education of the adult non-collegiate population ? How should the University organise extension lectures, vacation terms and other measures to this end ?

VI. Relation of University and Government (Question 35)

35. What should be the relation of the Government of India and of the Government of Bombay to the University of Bombay and to any new Universities that may be created ? What modifications, if any, do you think necessary in the existing powers of the Chancellor and of Government to control University finance, legislation, appointments of University Officers and Teachers and membership of University bodies ? What should be the relation, if any, of the Director of Public Instruction and the Minister in charge of Education to the University ?

VIII. Curricula (Questions 41-44)

41. Are you generally satisfied with the subject and curricula at present prescribed for the various University Examinations ? If not, can you indicate the changes you desire ?
42. Are you in favour of establishing (a) an absolute or (b) a greater

differentiation of the pass and honours courses ? How would such differentiation affect the Colleges and Students?

43. Would you approve of an absolute exclusion of science from the Arts Courses ? Do you approve of the present dissociation of Literature and Arts from the study of science ?

44. Do you consider the existing courses for the Bachelor's and Master's degree provide a sufficient variety of options and satisfactory combinations and correlation of Courses of Study ?

IX. Use of the Vernacular (Questions 45-46)

45. To what stage and to what extent do you consider the vernacular can and should be used to replace English as the medium of instruction and examination (a) in Bombay, (b) in any newly constituted University ? What safeguards do you suggest to secure that the standard of English required by students does not suffer from such replacement ?

46. What do you consider the best method of promoting the scientific study of the Vernaculars of this Presidency and for encouraging the production of good vernacular literature of all kinds ?

XIII. Special Communities (Question 52)

52. Do you consider any special measures are required for the promotion of University education in any particular community ?

*WRITTEN EVIDENCE BY DR. B. R. AMBEDKAR

Question 1: I agree with the Inspectors of the Board of Education in England that the aim and functions of University Education should be to see that the teaching carried on there is suited to adults ; that it is scientific, detached and impartial in character; that it aims not so much at filling the mind of the student with fact or theories as at calling forth his own individuality, and stimulating him to mental effort; that it accustoms him to the critical study of the leading authorities, with perhaps, occasional reference to first hand sources of information, and that it implants in his mind a standard of thoroughness, and gives him a sense of the difficulty as well as the value of reaching at truth. The student so trained should learn to distinguish between what may fairly be called matter of fact and what is certainly mere matter of opinion. He should be accustomed to distinguish issues, and to look at separate questions each on its own merits and without an eye to their bearing on some cherished theory. He should learn to state fairly, and even sympathetically, the position of those to whose practical conclusions he is most stoutly opposed. He should become able to examine a suggested idea, and see what comes of it, before accepting it or rejecting it. Without necessarily becoming an original student he should gain an insight into the conditions under which original research is

carried on. He should be able to weigh evidence, to follow and criticise argument and put his own value on authorities.

I see no reason why the aim and functions of the University Education in the Bombay Presidency should be different. Judged by the quality of the students it turns out it must be said that the existing system of University Education in this Presidency has totally failed to realise the aim and functions of University Education.

Question 2: It is possible that this failure springs partly from the spirit and methods of the instructor, partly of the pupils and partly from the conditions of education antecedent to the students' entrance to the University. In my opinion, however, the failure springs mainly from the administrative and educational machinery of the University. Before a University can be in a position to fulfil the aims and functions of University Education it must be so organized that it becomes essentially a place of learning, where a Corporation of Scholars labour in comradeship for the training of men and the advancement and diffusion of knowledge. In the light of these remarks it will be obvious that the Bombay University in the first place is no true University. It is not a Corporation of Scholars. It does not undertake the training of men and it is not directly interested in the advancement and diffusion of knowledge. On the other hand, the Bombay University in respect of its administration and educational machinery is what a University ought not to be. It is a Corporation of Administrators. It is only concerned with the examination of candidates while the advancement and diffusion of knowledge is outside the ambit of its interests.

Question 3: The University of Bombay has not promoted knowledge of and mutual interest in and sympathy for the history and culture of the different communities in this Presidency. A purely examining University that does not concern itself with inculcating the love of learning cannot achieve this object. And it seems to me that the only way of success along this line is first of all to convert the University into a Teaching University.

Questions 4-7: I do not feel I am competent to answer these questions satisfactorily. I agree that a great deal depends upon what kind of "stuff" the University gets from the high schools. How to get the right kind of stuff is a problem with every University. But I cannot understand why a University should be required to enter upon the control of high schools in order to compel them to produce the required kind of stuff. I know of no University that has undertaken this responsibility. All that the Universities do is to hold their own entrance examination whereby they select the kind of stuff they want by their test papers. I do not see why the Bombay University should be called upon to do more.

Questions 8-10: There are in my opinion two distinct problems that must arise in any attempt that may be made for converting the University of Bombay into a Teaching University. They are (i) how to convert it into a Commission which recommended that the Universities might justify their existence as teaching bodies by making further provision for advanced courses Teaching University and (ii) how to organize its teaching. With the first problem I will deal when I come to questions 36-40. Here I will deal with the second problem. In the Incorporation Act of 1857 no provision was made for allowing the University to undertake teaching functions. The Act of 1904 for the first time described the University as being incorporated for the purpose (among others) of "making provision for the instruction of students ", a phrase which might seem to have been intended to include undergraduates in putting into practice this clause all the older Universities have followed the University of study. As a result of this we find today that the undergraduate teaching has been separated from the postgraduate teaching, the former being taken up by the University and the latter left to the colleges.

I am totally opposed to any such sharp division between post-graduate and undergraduate training. My reasons are as follows :—

(1) The separation of post-graduate work from undergraduate work means the separation of teaching from research. But it is obvious that that where research is divorced from teaching research must suffer. As has been well observed by the Commissioners of 1911 on University Education in London.

" 69. Teaching will, of course, predominate in the earlier work, and research will predominate in the advance work : but it is in the best interests of the University that the most distinguished of its professors should take part in the teaching of the undergraduates from the beginning of their University career. It is only by coming into contact with the junior students that a teacher can direct their minds to his own conception of his subject, and train them in his own methods and hence obtain the double advantage of selecting the best men for research, and getting the best work out of them. Again it is the personal influence of the man doing original work in his subject which inspires belief in it, awakens enthusiasm, gains disciples. His personality is the selective power by which those who are fittest for his special work are voluntarily enlisted in its services and his individual influence is reproduced and extended by the spirit which actuates his staff. Neither is it the few alone who gain; all honest students gain inestimably from association with teachers who show them something of the working of the thought of independent and original minds. ' Any one ', says Helmholtz, ' who has once come into contact with one or more men of the first rank must have had his whole mental standard altered for the rest of his life '. Lectures have not lost their use and books can never fully take

the place of the living spoken word. Still less can they take the place of the more intimate teaching in laboratory and seminar, which ought not to be beyond the range of the ordinary course of a university education, and in which the student learns, not only conclusions and the reasons supporting them, all of which he might get from books but the actual process of developing thought, the working of the highly trained and original mind."

" 70. If it is thus to be desired that the highest university teachers should take their part in undergraduate work and that their spirit dominate it all, it follows for the same reasons that they should not be deprived of the best of their students when they reach the stage of post-graduate work. This work should not be separated from the rest of the work of the University, and conducted by different teachers in separate institutions. As far as the teacher is concerned it is necessary that he should have post-graduate students under him. He must be doing original work himself, and he often obtains material assistance from the co-operation of advanced students. Their very difficulties are full of suggestions, and their faith and enthusiasm are a pay source of refreshment and strength. He escapes the flagging spirit and the moods of lethargy which are apt to overtake the solitary worker. There can be no question of a higher class of teachers than the professors of the University, or the whole position of the University will be degraded. On the other hand, a university teacher of the highest rank will naturally desire to have as his post-graduate students those students whom he has already begun to train in his own methods, though his laboratory or seminar will, of course, be open to students who come from other universities, and to some perhaps who come from no university at all, as well as to some who come from other teachers of the University of London. There must be a great deal of give and take, and students may often gain by studying under more than one teacher of the same subject; but that is an entirely different thing from separating the higher work from the lower. We do not think it would be possible to get the best men for University Professorship if they were in any way restricted from doing the highest work or prevented from spreading their net wide to catch the best students."

"71. It is also a great disadvantage to the undergraduate students of the University that post-graduate students should be removed to separate institutions. They ought to be in constant contact with those who are doing more advanced work than themselves, and who are not too far beyond them, but stimulate and encourage them by the familiar presence of an attainable ideal."

The disastrous consequences which follow to advanced research work where it is separated from teaching have become patent at least to me. It is a

notorious fact that many Indian students who have returned with postgraduate degrees from the University of London and other universities have been failures in the sense that they have failed to master their subjects although some of them occupy the highest posts in the educational line. The reason for this is to be found in the fact that their under-graduate training was utterly insufficient for advanced research work. The Committee will remember that post-graduate training is very modern in its origin and conception. There were men at Cambridge and Oxford who did a great deal of excellent work although those universities did not have post-graduate departments. Even now the men at the head of post-graduate departments at Oxford, Cambridge and London are only graduates and yet they are doing their work of directing post-graduate research remarkably well so as to attract students from all parts of the world. The reason is that their undergraduate training was of a high order. I am, therefore, bound to emphasise that the University must undertake the training of the undergraduates if it intends to rear a structure of a sound system of post-graduate work.

- (2) Secondly, the assumption by the University of direct responsibility for teaching in the post-graduate sphere by its own staff which is regarded as a great reform tends to produce the unhappy effect of placing the university staff in antithesis and in opposition to the college staff which feels that its status is unreasonably reduced by the formal and practically permanent limitation of the colleges to an inferior sphere of work.
- (3) Thirdly, the establishment of a distinct University Professoriate for post-graduate work is a sheer waste of the resources of the University and can be easily avoided by a proper husbanding of the resources of the colleges. In our system of University education the colleges are the only places of learning. But they are at present the property of separate bodies and the management of each college is vested in a separate governing body. The income derive from a college goes to its own fund. If there is any surplus after the necessary expenses it only serves to swell this fund. Each college teaches the same subjects as the rest and is so to say a 'pocket' university obliged to maintain a competent staff to teach all the subjects and to provide separate libraries and laboratories for their own use. Autonomous as these colleges are none of them is financially a wealthy institution to be able to engage a first class and adequate staff and to provide a first class and adequate equipment in the form of libraries and laboratories. Owing to their slender resources the college staff is handicapped and overburdened. Being obliged to teach too many subjects specialization becomes impossible and a college professor under these circumstances has neither the inducement nor the opportunity to become the master of a small branch of a *great* subject. As an inevitable result of this

system of autonomous self-sufficing colleges we have scattered here and there poor professoriates, poor libraries and poor laboratories. But because the existing resources seem insufficient when looked upon as attached to or dissipated among the different colleges it does not follow that the resources of the colleges in the aggregate are not great enough to cope with the teaching of the post-graduate and undergraduate work of the Bombay University. Take for instance the resources of the colleges situated in the City of Bombay for the purpose of teaching economics.

We have in the City of Bombay the following colleges providing training in Economics for the B.A. Course of the Bombay University :—(1) Elphin-stone College, (2) Wilson College, (3) St. Xavier's College and (4) Sydenham College. There are two men teaching economics at the Elphinstone, two at the Wilson, two at the St. Xavier's and some six or so at the Sydenham College. Together there are about 12 men in the City of Bombay engaged in the teaching of economics. I know of no university in the world which has such a large number of men engaged in the teaching of one subject and yet all this plethora of professors is running to waste merely for the want of a better organization. And the University instead of attempting to stop this waste had added to it by the appointing of two more professors of its own to the existing lot.

It is however obvious that if these colleges could be induced to pool their teaching and library resources it would not only produce a strong specialised professoriate but it will produce a professoriate adequate to deal with both undergraduate and post-graduate work and thus obviate the waste of university resources on the two university chairs of economics. To bring this about one has only to arrange that these twelve men do combine together to distribute among themselves the work of carrying out the economics curriculum of the University and agree to lecture to all students taking that course irrespective of the colleges in which they are enrolled. The same plan could be easily adopted in organizing the teaching of other subjects in the colleges in the City of Bombay. The only difficulty probably in the way of this plan is of the students having to run from college to college to attend these lectures. This difficulty can be easily met. I should say that all lectures on Political Science shall be delivered at the Sydenham College. All lectures on Philosophy and Psychology shall be delivered at the Wilson College and all lectures on Literature and languages shall be delivered at the Elphinstone College. By this arrangement the frequent run of students between colleges will be entirely obviated. The colleges should be declared to be halls of lectures on a particular subject and the lectures while remaining on the foundations of their respective colleges will coalesce together so as to form a

homogeneous group and will have rooms at the college which is assigned for the subject they will be dealing with, and which will contain the portions of the libraries of the colleges on that particular subject.

I agree that University should be a centralised institution and if the plan of a new University were to be laid down *ab integro* it would be better to rule out the type in which a university was to be composed of affiliated colleges. But it must be recognized that universities cannot be sown broadcast and that where a number of institutions of collegiate status have come into being they cannot be lightly abolished in order to promote the success of centralizing institution. Under the plan I have outlined neither the standard of university education nor the independence of colleges is sacrificed. Administratively the colleges remain independent. Educationally they become integral parts of the University. In short the position becomes somewhat like the position at Oxford and Cambridge where the university is the colleges and the colleges form the university. Such an organization makes the most of the existing colleges and eliminates the waste.

Question 25 : My scheme of organizing University Education applies only to those centres where the colleges are situated in close proximity. If this scheme is to be utilised on a large scale the first thing to do is to control the location of colleges so that they shall be established in close proximity. In other words it is necessary to prevent adventurous educationists from opening individual autonomous colleges in all sorts of unseemly and unpromising towns. When one recalls the waste, duplication and dissipation of resources involved in the existence of such separate and scattered colleges one is surprised to see that such anarchical situation should have been tolerated so far. I regard it a great piece of good fortune for the Bombay Presidency that the growth of these isolated colleges has not as yet become so rank and wild as in Bengal. But steps must be taken at once to counteract the establishment of scattered colleges at random if the standard of University Education is to be maintained. For this purpose I should lay down the centres of University Education in this Presidency and should not allow any college to be started at any other place. In my opinion the following places should be marked as actual or potential centres of University Education:—

| | |
|----------------------|---------------------------|
| I—Bombay | VI—Hyderabad (potential). |
| II—Poona | VII—Dharwar (potential). |
| III—Ahmedabad | VIII—Sangli (potential). |
| IV—Surat (potential) | IX—Nasik (potential). |
| v—Karachi | X—Amalner (potential). |

Having defined the centres of University education the next thing to do is to

organize the teaching at those places. At most of the above University centres there is as yet only a single college providing education in Arts. Only in Bombay and Poona are there groups of colleges in close proximity. There the problem of University teaching can be easily solved by permutation and combination of the various college staffs into departments. At those centres where there are as yet only a single isolated college the problem of providing education of the university type can be solved in two ways (1) by allowing the foundation of new colleges in close proximity of the existing ones for the purpose of teaching one particular subject or (2) by recognizing the existing college as a university and to allow it to expand by starting new departments of study. The former plan seems to be easier of success. But the latter would be better from the standpoint of efficiency. By adopting this policy instead of having a number of colleges scattered through the different parts of the Presidency to meet the educational demands in those parts of the Presidency we would be able to have other universities in other parts of the Presidency to meet the educational demands in those parts. By this we may not have achieved the ideal of a centralised university. But we may at least be achieving the next best of having all the colleges which are affiliated to a university situated in the university town in close proximity of one another to combine together in intellectual co-operation and make the university so to say a living personality.

Question 28: Bombay and Poona are the only places ripe for immediate expansion into universities and I suggest that these be at once incorporated into separate universities. Ahmedabad is likely to be ripe in the near future. It has already an Arts College and a Science Institute and may be converted into a University.

Pending the establishment of universities in the centres marked above the three universities of Bombay, Poona and Ahmedabad should have an external side like the University of London whereby arrangements could be made to grant degrees to students of the other colleges appearing at their examinations.

If the future universities to be established in this Presidency shape themselves into centralised institutions then the problems raised in these questions will not arise. For, then, the university will be in full control of its staff and teaching arrangements. But I will assume that our future universities will be a cluster or constituent colleges independent in their organization. At any rate it will be so of the new universities of Bombay and Poona. Under the scheme of having constituent colleges, the colleges will still continue to be places licensed by the university to provide University education. The plan of inter-collegiate teaching will remove the waste duplication and dissipation of resources by the constituent colleges. But will that arrangements be sufficient to ensure that the

standard of university education will be maintained at a high level. That depends upon the standing of the teaching staff engaged in imparting University education. At present the teachers are attached to the colleges and their pay and status are regulated by the authorities governing the colleges. But the colleges do not seem to be making the appointments solely from the sense of obtaining the most qualified persons nor regulating their grades, tenure, pay and promotion in such a manner as to open a career to the best and most qualified member of the staff. The whole educational work carried on by Government is entrusted to the educational services in the three grades of which are included all the administrative and inspecting officers, and all the teachers in Government colleges and schools from the most responsible to the most junior. As in all services the principle of seniority is so deeply rooted that it has become a sacred convention that all superior posts should go by seniority. The principal drawback of this system so far as the work of University education is concerned is that rewards are regulated not by depth of scholarship but by the length of service. Teachers of a college who are subject to be transferred from place to place as is the case with the members of the Government service cannot but feel that the body corporate which claims their loyalty and obedience is not the college but the service and more often than not their ambition is directed to securing service promotions than that of creating a school of learning with which their names *will* be identified. The invidious distinction drawn between the I.E.S. and P.E.S. is another weakness of the service system in that it tempts even the very junior members of the former to regard themselves as the superior of the most senior and distinguished members of the latter. This introduces an element of friction among the members of the college staff rendering difficult that free and friendly co-operation which is so indispensable to promote the intellectual life of any educational institution. Last but by no means the least in importance is the fact that under the present circumstances the professors in the Government colleges by reason of their being servants of the Government have lost the confidence of their students. The students instead of regarding their professors as their intellectual leaders regard them as the agents of Government and the professors receiving no response from their students drudge on without kindling their interest and winning their allegiance. In the colleges maintained by Missionary bodies the leading members of the staff are European Missionaries. The rest of the staff consists of Indian teachers. The distinction between the I.E.S. and P.E.S. is reproduced there on a small scale though it is not quite so emphasized as to produce open friction. In the private colleges maintained by Societies, such as the Deccan Education Society all the members of the staff are the members of the Society. The staff

here is therefore more homogeneous and has nothing in its organization to lead to any cleavage. But the constitution of these colleges restricts them to the appointment of men who care to become life members of the Societies which control them. I cannot speak very definitely about the prospects offered by these private colleges but it is certain that they are very poor even when compared with the lowest grades in the Government colleges and indeed they are so poor that they cannot attract men of moderate attainments unless the same can afford to maintain a large margin of disinterestedness. But it is not the private colleges alone that fail to procure proper persons to fill their vacant posts. Even Government colleges with the best of prospects seldom succeed in hitting upon the right sort of a person. The reason is that neither have any proper machinery for making a judicious selection. In the case of Government colleges it is the Director of Public Instruction or the Secretary to Government that makes the choice. But as a matter of fact they are the most inexperienced people for this task. Similarly the appointments in the private colleges are mostly in the hands of the heads of the colleges and they too are incapable of making proper choices. The fault lies in not recognizing that to assess the merits of a person one must belong to his kind. It will take an economist to judge an economist.

Quite apart however from these difficulties and drawback there is no possible means of bringing a University staff thus recruited by the different colleges into a due relation, as regards either its members or its distribution, to University needs. The University might find itself supplied with half a dozen professors of one subject and without a single in another equally important branch of knowledge. University organization cannot proceed on these lines, and the difficulties described above can be removed only by placing the appointments of all teachers of the University in the hands of the University itself acting through the Academic Council (see constitution of the new University) or at least by giving the University an effective voice in their appointment.

I therefore propose that the collegiate branch of the Educational Service should be separated from the Administrative branch and should be placed under the University with proper safeguards. In other words the teachers' posts at the different colleges should be converted into chairs attached to and supported by certain foundations in the present case by the private colleges and Government. But the appointments to these chairs should be controlled by the University.

I attach the greatest importance to the control of the University over the appointment of its teaching staff. Hitherto the University of Bombay has attempted to maintain the standard of University education by means of its

power to test it by a rigid system of examination. The result has been a gradual lowering of the calibre of its graduates. This is principally to be attributed to the egregious error committed by the fathers of our University education in not at all recognizing that the only means of maintaining the standard of University education are the rigid exclusion of students who are unfit for University studies and the existence of a body of highly qualified and productive teachers, organized in departments adequately equipped. In other words they attempted to maintain the standard of the University degrees without attempting to maintain the standard of the teachers and the taught. When events are moving us in the direction of making the University of Bombay a teaching University, it must be clearly realised that " the power to control teaching is of more importance than the power to test it by granting degrees ". A University cannot become a teaching University unless its academic affairs, i.e., teaching and examination are left to the uncontrolled discretion of those engaged in teaching. But it will be fatal to the standard of a University degree if the University reposed such a large trust in a body of teachers in whose calibre it has no confidence. I therefore propose that the University should have the power of purse over the colleges. All Government grants to the colleges should be made through the University, so that the University will have a voice in the appointment of the staff of teachers and their equipment in the matter of libraries and laboratories.

Questions 36-39: If a University as a corporation of learning is to serve the community, then its constitution must provide (a) for a body which will keep it in touch with all varied requirements of the community; (b) for a body which will give the University a statesman-like guidance in the provision and also in accommodation of means to ends so as to bring about a working compromise between the possible misconceptions of the public and the possibly too narrow outlook of the scholar; and (c) for a body of scholars engaged in the work of teaching to give an authoritative direction to the academic business of the University.

I want to impress upon the Committee that a University does not become a teaching University merely by engaging in the work of teaching through the agency of its own staff. That is not the criterion of a teaching University. A University may undertake teaching and yet may not be a teaching University. Whether or not a University is a teaching University depends upon whether or not the scholars engaged in the work of teaching have the authoritative direction of the academic business of the University in their hands. If it is in their hands then the University is a teaching University. If it is not in their hands then the University is not a teaching University. A teaching University is a teachers University.

I am led to make these preliminary remarks because I feel that the Committee in inviting answers to its questions on the constitution is motivated by the desire to obtain such suggestions as will help to make the University of Bombay a teaching University. The existing constitution of the University of Bombay does not provide in any adequate or clear cut manner any of the three bodies I have said to be necessary for a University to function properly. The Senate of the University is not sufficiently representative of the life and interests of Bombay. The Syndicate has not the responsibilities and powers which should devolve upon the Executive Council of a great University and often has devolved upon it duties which it is absolutely unfit to perform. While the teaching staff which is really the heart of the University has practically no voice, let alone authoritative direction, in the academic affairs of the University.

To make the University of Bombay a teaching University I would first of all proceed to the constitution of faculties. For this purpose I will take it that my scheme of inter-collegiate teaching between the colleges situated in the City of Bombay is adopted. Under that scheme the several studies pursued in the colleges will naturally have to be grouped into Departments, e.g.. Economics, History, Politics, Administration, Law, Literature, Languages, Chemistry, Physics, etc. It will be admitted that students are receiving at a University their final systematic preparation for one or other of the several occupations of life for which a University education is necessary at any rate, the most advantageous preliminary.

To succeed in this it is necessary to group together certain branches of knowledge which students pursue. Not only do the needs of students require such a grouping but the needs of the teachers point in the same direction, for it is obvious that certain studies have a closer relation between them and there is a greater similarity in the point of view from which they are approached. These forces emanating from the teachers and the taught have led everywhere the grouping of the several departments of study into what are called Faculties. I suggest therefore that the Departments in the new University of Bombay should be grouped into Faculties and the Faculties should be made the basis of the University organisation if our University is to be a teaching University. A faculty should consist, either wholly or mainly of the Professors and Assistant Professors of the subjects comprised within the Faculty; and of such other teachers and officers appointed by the University as the Faculty may co-opt. The Vice-Chancellor should *ex-officio* be a member of every faculty. A Faculty should have the power to make Regulations—

(i) to appoint Committees consisting of the Faculty together with other persons

- to act as Board of Studies and for other purposes;
- (ii) to determine generally the conditions for the award of degrees, diplomas, and other distinctions within the purview of the Faculty:
 - (iii) to determine generally the course of study to be pursued by students of the University in the subjects within the purview of the Faculty ;
 - (iv) to determine generally the method and manner of teaching and examination with regard to the subjects within the purview of the Faculty. I must say again that if the Faculties are to be entrusted with the powers set out above and the teachers are to be freed from the restrictions imposed by a common syllabus of instruction and a general quasi-external examination, it is necessary to make sure that the teachers are worthy of the trust imposed in them.

The Faculties should be the constituent bodies of the University. Having constituted our Faculties to take charge of the academic and educational work of the University, we must constitute a Central Governing Body to take charge of the administrative work of the University. This body should correspond to the existing Senate of the Bombay University but should be entirely different in character and composition. In my opinion the Senate as a supreme governing body should be comparatively a large body mainly non-professional in character but including representatives of graduates and the teachers. The advantages of such a mode of government are obvious. By mean? of a large Senate a number of influential citizens, chosen because of their individual capacity, and of representatives of the great interests of the town, municipal, administrative, commercial, legal, scientific, etc., and of members of Legislative Council, the Assembly and the Council of State are brought into touch with the University and serve as channels between the University and the community as a whole. Such a Senate will be able to ask for support to the University with greater authority and success and the whole city will feel interested in the success of the University.

But the Universities Commission of 1902 regarded it as a fault of the system and reported that the Senates of the Universities were too bulky in numbers (in 1900 the Senate of the Bombay University consisted of 305 fellows) and incapable of exercising proper control in educational matters. That Commission did not understand that the proper function of the Senate was not to control the education but to keep the University in touch with all the varied requirements of the community. That being the function of the Senate it must necessarily be large and varied in its composition. I propose that the Senate of the University of Bombay should be composed of 150 members. One of the most important changes effected under the Universities Act of 1904 was the provision that two-fifths of the Ordinary Fellows should be associated with the profession of teaching. As a preventive of the system in which Fellowships

were bestowed by way of compliment without due regard to the qualifications of the recipient this proviso was a salutary proviso. But in view of the proposal I advocate of giving greatly increased statutory powers to the Faculties, I do not think that the teachers in the University need more representation on the Senate than is sufficient to enable each of the Faculties to have a spokesman. I, therefore, propose to restrict the representation of the teachers to the Deans of the Faculties. The rest of the Senate should be composed of persons in the political or commercial world and interest in education may be able to render the University substantial service.

The chief function of the Senate would be legislation— (1) to make statutes affecting the Government of the University and pass resolutions,

(2) to confer all honorary degrees,

(3) to approve of the admission of constituent colleges or University departments,

(4) to institute any new degree, diploma, or certificate,

(5) to decide disputes between Faculties. Having provided for the two bodies

one to look after the Government of the University and the other to take charge of the academic business of the University, we have now to provide for third body charged with the provision and also the accommodation of means *to ends*. In other words there must be a Central Executive of the University.

This body should correspond to the existing Syndicate of the Bombay University but should be entirely different in character and composition. The Syndicate appears, both as to its composition and the conditions of its work, the least satisfactory of all the University bodies. As a supreme executive the Syndicate should have the custody and use of the Common Seal, the management of the whole revenue and property of the University and (except as otherwise provided) the conduct of all the affairs of the University. But instead of this the work of the Syndicate has been extended over a wide field of business much of which might be conveniently entrusted to other and more appropriate bodies. The existing system concentrates in a so-called executive the work rather of discussion than of deliberate decision. I, therefore, propose to abolish the Board of Accounts and transfer its functions to the Syndicate which shall have power to determine—

(1) The finance, investments and accounts of the University.

(2) The amount and payment of fees to be exacted within the University, or in relation to the enjoyment of privileges therefrom.

(3) The terms and mode of appointment, tenure of and removal from office, duties, emoluments, allowances, salaries and superannuation allowances of the officers of the University, including its professors, teachers, registrars, librarians and permanent servants.

- (4) The tenure of office and terms and manner of appointment and the duties of the Assessors, Examiners and Examining Board.
- (5) The provisions and tenure of fellowships, scholarships, prizes, rewards, and pecuniary and other aids.
- (6) The provision, maintenance, and supervision of halls, hostels or other premises for the residence of students.
- (7) The admission of students as under-graduates of the University.
- (8) To deal with the real and personal property of the University.
- (9) To provide buildings, premises, furniture and apparatus and other means needed for carrying on the work of the University.
- (10) To borrow money for the University and to mortgage University property if necessary.
- (11) To enter into, vary, carry out and cancel contracts on behalf of the University.
- (12) To entertain, adjudicate upon and if thought fit redress any grievances of the officers of the University, the professors, the teaching staff, the graduates, under-graduates and the University servants who may feel aggrieved otherwise than by an act of the Senate.
- (13) To regulate the Government grants to the constituent colleges. These three bodies, the Senate, the Syndicate and the Faculties should be constituted by the Act of Incorporation and together they are enough to supply all the necessary organs of a great teaching University. But there seems to be a want for one more body for the new University of Bombay, particularly for the transition period that is bound to be very long before the mother colleges at the centre of University education ripen into Universities pending which they must remain affiliated to one or other of the newly organized teaching Universities in this Presidency. But even if this problem of making provision for the transition period was not there, the need for a fourth body in the management of a great teaching University would be felt nonetheless.

The plan of organization I have proposed is based more or less on the principle of separation of powers. The centre of legislative power is the Senate. The centre of executive power is the Syndicate and the centre of academic power is the Faculty. But if these separate powers are exercised independently and without any co-ordination, the result is bound to be injurious to the best interest of the University. A Faculty is here taken as the basis of University organization and is given complete autonomy in prescribing courses of study and arranging the teaching of and the examining work. But provision must be made for the control of all matters not expressly assigned to the Faculties, the settlement of matters affecting more than one Faculty, and for a final decision when differences arise between one Faculty and another. There is not only a

need for a body for co-ordinating the Faculties but there is also a need for a body for co-ordinating the Faculties and the Syndicate, otherwise the Syndicate by the exercise of its executive powers may seriously interfere in the academic freedom of the Faculties. The control of the purse must ultimately mean the control of all else and it is therefore necessary to ensure that the Syndicate shall not take any action having a direct educational bearing on the University as a whole without consultation with a body representative of the teaching staff as a whole. Thus whether as a feature of the transition period or as a permanent feature of University organization there is a clear necessity for the establishment of a fourth body in the act of incorporation. That body I propose to call the Academic Council. Its functions will be partly advisory and partly executive.

Its executive functions would include the determination by regulation or otherwise of all matters relating to—

- (1) The quorum to be required at meetings of the Faculties or at meetings of any Committees appointed by the Faculties.
- (2) The duties and powers of Advisory and other Boards, including Boards and Committees to be appointed by the University jointly with any other University or Body touching any educational matter.
- (3) The qualifications for honorary degrees and distinctions to be awarded by the University and the means and steps to be taken relative to the granting of the same.
- (4) The visitation of affiliated colleges.
- (5) The affiliation and disaffiliation of colleges.
- (6) The tenure of fellowships, scholarships, exhibitions and pecuniary and other aids.
- (7) The discipline to be enforced in regard to the graduates and undergraduates in so far as they come within the jurisdiction of the University.
- (8) The removal from membership of the University of graduates and undergraduates and the withdrawal of degrees, diplomas, certificates and distinctions, subject to an appeal to the Senate. The advisory functions of the Academic Council shall be as follows :
 - (i) The Syndicate shall not make any decision in regard to any matter relating to the organisation, improvement, and extension of University education, both under-graduate and post-graduate without first inviting and receiving a report thereon from the Academic Council.
 - (ii) The Syndicate shall not issue general directions to the Faculties, or review any act of any Faculty or of any Committee or Board of a Faculty, other than the election of an officer or representative of such body, upon the appeal of any other Faculty or give directions for their future action without first inviting

and receiving a report thereon from the Academic Council.

(iii) The Syndicate shall not make any appointment to the teaching staff without first inviting and receiving a report from the Academic Council.

The composition and strength of the Senate, the Syndicate and the Academic Council should be the same as proposed by the Calcutta University Commission for the new Calcutta University. I think it might be better to change as well the nomenclature and call the Senate, the Court and the Syndicate the State of the new University. I also propose that the Viceroy should be the Visitor of the University.

Question 16 : The University of Bombay may have been discharging the functions of (a) conducting examinations, (b) prescribing course of study, and (c) appointing text-books very well. But the University never seems to have paid attention to the pernicious effect of all this on the teacher and the taught. How to secure freedom for the University teacher to teach as he thinks best and not to restrict him by a hard and fast syllabus is a problem which should be in the forefront of the problems to be solved by this Committee. If freedom for the teacher can be obtained then freedom for the learner will follow. For this purpose the teachers of the University ought under proper safeguards to have entire control of the education and examination of their students and the University ought to be so constituted as to make this possible.

Question 17: Besides examination, students' work in colleges ought to be taken into account. For the higher degrees there should be thesis and oral examinations.

Questions 18 and 19 : The University of Bombay should have the Faculties of Engineering, Agriculture, Fine Arts, Technology and Music to make it a complete University.

Question 20: The duration of studies for post-graduate degrees should be four years (I am speaking only for social sciences). There should be two stages of two years each. At the end of the first stage the candidate should be entitled to the M.A. degree. He should specialise in one subject only which should be the subject of his major interest. The test should consist of a written examination accompanied by an essay of some 75 type-written pages showing his familiarity with the art of using original sources and commenting upon them. At the end of the second stage the candidate should be entitled to the Ph.D. degree. There the test would include an oral examination and a thesis of a respectable size fit for publication. The thesis will embody the investigations of the candidate in a particular field lying within the scope of the subject he had taken at the M.A. as being of major interest to him. Beside this the candidate will present himself for an oral examination in two subjects to be known as subjects of minor interest which will be allied to the subjects of his

major interest. This arrangement will allow specialization with a broad base.

Question 21: It may be well to have a few such degrees.

Question 22: By means of subventions, studentships and fellowships.

Question 23; Most essential to have a University press and publication department. Without this the post-graduate work will be considerably hampered.

Question 24: See answer to questions Nos. 11-13.

Question 30: Bombay University should confine itself to Bombay. New Universities should open their own departments. But if the new University is to be composed of colleges, then each college must confine itself to the teaching of one subject only.

Questions 31-33: See answer to questions Nos. 36-39.

Question 34; Spread of education should be a proper function of the University. But this cannot be achieved unless the University adopts vernacular as the medium of instruction which in the present circumstances is a far cry.

Question 35: Government should have no control over the academic affairs of the University which must be entirely entrusted to the Faculties. But Government should have some control over the legislative and administrative affairs of the University. This they should have by means of nominations to the Court and the Senate of the University.

Questions 41-44: I should leave these questions to the newly constituted Faculties. My opinion is that the curriculum even of the Honours Course provides a poor fare to the students.

Questions 45-46: I hold a very strong affirmative view on the use of vernacular as a medium of instruction. But I feel that the problem cannot be solved unless Indian public opinion decides which vernacular it selects for common intercourse.

Question 52: I think special measures are required for the promotion of University education among the Backward Classes and particularly the Depressed Classes.

Before closing my replies to the questionnaire I beg to express my surprise at the absolute disregard the Committee has shown in the matter of organizing a good Library. I cannot see how any University can function without a first rate library attached to it.

15th August 1924.

[Contents](#)